



**ISLAMORADA, VILLAGE OF ISLANDS
COMMUNITY WORKSHOP MEETING MINUTES
COAST SEA LEVEL RISE**

**Founders Park Community Center
87000 Overseas Hwy
Islamorada, FL 33036
Tuesday, October 7, 2014
5:30 PM**

In attendance: Mayor Ted Blackburn, Vice Mayor Deb Gillis, Councilman Ken Philipson, Councilman Dave Purdo, Village Manager Maria Aguilar, Village Attorney Roget Bryan, Assistant Village Manager Shane Laakso, Consultant Erin Deady, Consultant J.T. Lockman, Consultant acting as Recording Secretary Mitty Bernard, Panel Member Joe Roth, Panel Member David Makepeace, Panel Member Ana Zalesky, additional Village Staff Members and members of the community.

Meeting Minutes – October 7, 2014 Islamorada Community Workshop #1

A. Shane Laakso Introduction – 5:37pm

- Pledge of allegiance
- Brief history of how IslamoradaMatters project came about
- Introduced partners involved in project
- Turned it over to Erin Deady

B. Erin Deady Brief Overview – 5:40pm

- Turned over to JT Lockman 5:45pm

C. JT Lockman Presentation – started at 5:45pm

- o Piermont example:
 - JT's vulnerability assessment slide –
 - Audience Question – Are the estimates based on real time dollars or future dollars?
 - Presentation ended 6:17pm
 - Question & Answer session opened 6:17pm
 - How do you deal with future growth? You can increase building values over time if you know that things are going to be built, software has capability to do this
 - Has he worked scenario attempting to build levy? JT says he has not worked on anything like that, only time levy will work is when federal government pays for it (cities and counties won't have funds to do that)

D. Panel Discussion started 6:20pm

- Question 1 – from your perspective, what do you think the biggest concern is with regard to sea level rise within the Village of Islamorada?
 - o Panelist Joe Roth – damage to commercial structures, loss of life
 - o Panelist David Makepeace – as homeowner his concern is erosion, landscaping issues for normal sea level rise because vegetation cannot handle salt; property value
 - As biologist – whole new succession of vegetation will occur, loss of hammock, reef impacts that won't rise with the sea level, storms won't break on the reef like they do now, mangroves won't be same kind of buffer they are now
 - o Panelist Ana Zalesky – agrees with Joe Roth on safety issue; concern is property values and what is to become of them – can they be fortified, will we be able to save all of them?
 - Erin Deady says might need tools for financing
 - o Panelist Mayor Ted Blackburn – very optimistic because of Southeast Florida Regional Climate Change Compact (SEFRCCC); last week's conference in Miami Beach provided example of storm surge, having dramatic effect of sea and fresh water coming together; but in Keys there are tides that protect us – but concerned about initiative and whether community can look at them and figure out something to do about the seas rising – are we going to take steps to mitigate? Near term council will have to look at these issues, but there are things that we can do now to buy time – need to start now – his major concern that we are talking about it but might not be willing to take the necessary steps
- Question 2 – similarities with Piedmont?
 - o Panelist David Makepeace – need to set own baseline data to add into the scenario going forward (so that 2 feet from where has reference); need to use assessed value since only thing that will remain consistent regarding property values; need to figure out a factor (assessed value vs. sale value) to use; Cost/Benefit Analysis (CBA) individual and infrastructure/government CBA is helpful – good to have both since public doesn't have typical access to government info – side comment is that perception is the reality (we need to prepare without scaring tourists and future homebuyers) – need to keep emphasizing this to the community so not scaring people
 - o Panelist Joe Roth – similar most in the peninsular aspect, everything is coastal here too; from commercial property owner/homeowner side we need multi-prong approach (flood proofing structures) – walling is not going to be useful; different because we have a lot of runoff happening; he also likes blended property value (factor/multiplier included)
 - o Panelist Ana Zalesky – says different because Piedmont is a river community with dredged land; walling is not an option for us here, we are built on a rock (not dredged)
 - o Panelist Mayor Ted Blackburn – differences? Started by touching on insurance – FEMA analysis to determine what to charge residents – but we need to show that we are being proactive to take hardening steps (could result in financial benefit for all of us); talked about Sea Oats Park that breaches during all storm events; 200 yards on left from that the mangroves are almost underwater and the road is right there – we have to have the right data to make the correct decisions going forward; resaid he is optimistic that we can come up with good solutions

- Question 3 – unique characteristics of Islamorada?
 - o Panelist David Makepeace – some of the most valuable property in the Keys are in harm’s way to rising water and nuisance tides (waterside rests, resorts) – moving forward those places need our help in terms of CBA to determine what to do moving forward; different – don’t have large land masses that we are backed up against with high elevations – water can run around the Keys so not subject to storm surge – but porosity is an issue after storms; permitting issues - need to revise stormwater master plan to address what will happen
 - o Panelist Ana Zalesky – local economy relies on the water so important to look at what is going to happen so we can help ourselves as much as possible – since so dependent on water; how the locals live. Influx of second homes but locals see it different than those in Piermont – here most people live here and work here, makes it more important to our economy
 - o Panelist Joe Roth – need to take into account, Piermont has a lot more elevation but here we don’t have option to relocate – need to keep resorts on water not on US1 (or people won’t come here); residential concern/tax base concerns that several areas that were built on fill dirt that didn’t previously exist – substantial economic value in those areas that are very vulnerable to ground washing out from underneath them – make canals shallower, shore up docks, walls – also stormwater issue because of nature of fill areas
 - o Panelist Mayor Ted Blackburn – loved what Joe Roth said, have to look at totality of where we are, gave example of Lower Matecumbe Key – Sea Oats beach is low and breaches but because it does, the areas of Port Antigua survive since there is less of a storm surge (other places where not same flow have much worse flooding); Upper Matecumbe Key is rock – can you put tunnels between ocean and bay? – would that preserve recreate flow? (he doesn’t know); we are unique but there are ways to find solutions to keep us around for longer than we think; mentioned Hemingway article after 1935 wipeout – 400 veterans came here to rebuild but residents are here by choice – same with today’s residents, they choose to live here despite the perils though we must make efforts to stall and buy time
- Erin Deady’s recap – she heard the following concerns: limited land envelop, limited ability for growth, fill issue, canal systems issues/solutions
- Session ended 7:01pm for 5 minute break

E. Public Comment Period – Erin Deady started back up at 7:16pm

- Erin Deady turned presentation over to JT Lockman
- Using same numbers Jason Evans presented last month for infrastructure 3-7” by 2030 or 9-24” by 2060 – JT Lockman to use same numbers –
 - no objection from public
- Using Monroe County parcel data; surges from all years 10,25, 50 (2005 study is best we have) –
 - o 12 runs of the model will be done total – proposing to show damage from 8 single storms
 - o Erin Deady explained difference between nuisance flooding (1.08’) and Wilma storm event (6’)
 - o Once results are obtained, then extrapolate places in between or times in between

- Doing whole area rather than select areas – though more consistent based on infrastructure work being done by Jason Evans
- Comments on dates, storms being modeled
 - Public (Sue Miller) – as water rises, effect is different because of reef height and mangroves - observation is drastic difference in effect of hurricanes if come from Bay or Ocean side – is that being considered? No, when you make models, you have to simplify things – results that are overestimated will be balanced with those that are underestimated, model doesn't factor wind, just using FEMA numbers of how high water will rise – can do more complicated water modeling that takes into account wind, shape of bottom, wave shape but would cost million for the Keys
 - Panelist David Makepeace comment – if Wilma-type flood worst on Ocean side is 6 feet and worst on Bay side is 6 feet – surges not seen greater than that – if 10 feet surges, no hardening options will work
 - Councilman Ken Philipson – interested in seeing total Islamorada modeled, not just a specific portion in Islamorada
- Elevation of mean high tide – using Vaca Key gauge, explained mean higher high water (MHHW) data since they have that at Vaca Key, using that as the starting point –
 - No Comments from public
- Subsidence – JT Lockman said not really an issue, mostly in other areas, so we are not proposing to use and subsidence data in model –
 - No Comments from public
- Location of 100 year flood zone – proposing to use 2005 flood maps, divide the Village into subareas to look at all parcels with particular flood height, will then do separate runs of the model based on different characteristics; will likely divide Village into 8 different areas so 12 runs of 8 = 96 total runs of the model
 - No Comments from public
- Surge height, flood insurance data – using 2005 flood insurance study –
 - No Comments from public
- Topography – obtained LiDAR data (measured every 3 feet to within 2-3 inch accuracy); proposing to use 5 meter data (measured every 15' to same accuracy)
- JT Lockman asked the audience if anything bothering them so far, if they would do anything different?
 - Deb Gillis said 300 ft property with 10' height variance on her property – questioned if same elevation every 15' is accurate enough – JT Lockman explained that it was
 - Panelist Joe Roth – asked how are we going to value? Transcends so many issues
 - JT Lockman says use digital tax map for buildings and lots; first thing is Jason Evans has worked with tax assessors to make sure everything is properly classified by use, also put in year built for each building, can then assign different depth damage function to each property
 - JT Lockman says one decision to make here is about property values – use assessed value or apply sales ratio with a multiplier?
 - Up to the audience as to what they want? What does the audience want?
 - Public responses:

- Panelist Ana Zalesky says definitely apply 15-20% to assessed value (because assessed values are running lower on average)
- Panelist David Makepeace says we don't need to set number – but wants to see some multiplier because if the assessed values are off, that will make a big difference in CBA in determining what to do going forward – especially in commercial and public properties - says assessed values are not accurate and lag behind market value (Erin Deady says 115% is best data so far – Panelist Ana Zalesky asked if this pertained to residential or commercial or both – Erin Deady said she needs to follow up but the 115% is aggregate number)
- Seems to be consensus that there needs to be a multiplier but not much public comment on by how much
- Panelist Mayor Ted Blackburn says they use total assessed appraised value to determine value of village – they discovered in last 4 years is that there is a 2 yr lag on that – after end of recession it took 2 years to reflect end of recession – he says 10-15% sounds ok but doesn't know how to quantify the 2 year lag in data if you use the assessed values – says we need to use multiplier but doesn't know what it should be
- JT Lockman says this could be a project for staff – if you have last 5 years of sales and 5 years of assessed values – could determine the ratio with actual data
 - Someone (Ken Philipson) in audience public said don't do that calculation because then you get into lag issue – just need to pick
 - Deb Gillis asked how many people Erin Deady had consulted – Erin responded three total
 - She then asked if consistent across entire Keys or just Islamorada – Ana Zalesky says across keys that it is 15-20%
 - Panelist David Makepeace said we want higher number, some ground proofing is good – he is comfortable with 15% since somewhat close to real values when doing CBA
 - Erin Deady suggested more ground truthing within a certain range – if we fall within range then people will feel ok about the percentage

