Landmark Commission July 14th, 2020 Remote Meeting Minutes

Meeting called to order:

Chairman Dr. Berkey called the meeting to order at 4:33pm. The following members were present: Mr. Michael Zuilhof, Mr. Jon Lawrence, Mr. Joe Galea, Dr. Tim Berkey, and Mr. Ryan Nagel. Mr. Alan Griffiths and Commissioner Mike Meinzer were not present. Mr. Thomas Horsman represented the Planning Department, Mr. Trevor Hayberger represented the Law Department, and Mr. Scott Thom represented the Community Development Department.

Review of minutes from June 23rd, 2020:

Mr. Galea made a motion to approve the minutes and Mr. Lawrence seconded the motion. All members were in favor of the motion and the minutes were approved.

Presentation from the Sandusky State Theater:

Chris Parthemore, Executive Director of the Sandusky State Theater, explained to the Landmark Commission the damage that has been done to the theater due to the storm that hit not too long ago, and everything they are doing to try to save as much of the building as possible and the items inside the building. He said that they are currently in the demolition phase and would like to have an architectural firm on board by the end of this year to develop a plan for rebuilding.

1st application:

Dr. Berkey stated that the first application on the agenda is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations at 142 Columbus Ave, known as the Barra building.

Mr. Horsman stated that the façade of the building has been so heavily altered over the years that the first and second stories retain little to no original historic features. Staff do not believe replacing the three windows on the second floor with a singular sliding window would not be detrimental to the historic character of the building. Therefore staff recommend approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Galea made a motion to approve the application as submitted and Mr. Lawrence seconded the motion. All members were in favor of the motion and the motion passed.

2nd application:

Dr. Berkey stated that the second application on the agenda is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of 119 E. Market St, owned by Cook Building, LLC.

Mr. Horsman stated that also on the line is the applicant Jeff Foster with Payto Architects, Rick Hogrefe, owner of the building, Mike and Sharon Salmon with H2 Property Management, and Scott Thom, Chief Building Official for the City, if anyone has any questions from them. He said that staff's preference is always to maintain historical buildings as opposed to tearing them down. However, staff also recognize that the building is currently in a poor structural state and that the applicant has proposed maintaining as much of the material from the original structure as possible. The structural engineer's report stated that their opinion was that the masonry on the building should be removed as required down to sound structure and then rebuilt, but parts of the report indicated that further investigation is required to understand the full extent of the damage. Considering all the factors, staff does not have a conclusive recommendation on the demolition of 119 E. Market, other than what the Chief Building Official recommends.

Mr. Foster stated that as the Cooke Building was being taken down, the condition of the 119 E. Market St. building appeared to be in worse condition than they had originally been able to see. He stated that there is not much building structure behind the façade. Also, in order to keep the look of the façade, they would need to do all new brick and cornice work. He said that they intend to replicate the existing façade with new construction.

Dr. Berkey stated that most of the issues Mr. Foster pointed out in the building that are part of the reason for demolishing it, were visibly apparent a year ago, when they stated that the building was stable. He said that the one thing that is different from a year ago is the damage due to the demolition of the Cooke building. Futhermore, there have been other buildings downtown that have been recently damaged, including the State Theater and the building on Water St., and instead of deciding to demolish those buildings, they are working to restore those buildings.

Mr. Zuilhof asked for clarification on which components of the facade of are proposed to be salvaged for a new building and which items will be replicated and reproduced.

Mr. Foster stated that he was the architect on the Water St. building and the façade on that building was stable, whereas this building's façade is not. The intent with this building was to save the façade. The damage to the façade may have been due to the demolition of the Cooke Building, but they were not able to see what shape the façade was in until the Cooke Building came down. As far as the elements of the building that they are planning on keeping are the stone elements around the windows, the windows will be removed and reinstalled, there will be new brick, the stone brackets that have a C in them will be saved and reinstalled, the four cast iron rosettes that will be removed and reinstalled, the wood cornice will be replicated in all new materials.

Mr. Lawrence made a motion to deny the demolition of the building, and Mr. Zuilhof seconded the motion. All members were in favor of the motion, and the application has been denied.

3rd application:

Dr. Berkey stated that the last application on the agenda is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new construction of the Hogrefe-Cooke Building.

Mr. Horsman stated that staff believes the plans for the new Hogrefe-Cooke Building conform with the Sandusky Preservation Design Guidelines as well as the Secretary of the Interior Standards and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Mr. Lawrence made a motion to approve the development plans for the new Hogrefe-Cooke Building, and Mr. Galea seconded the motion.

Mr. Zuilhof asked for clarification on whether or not this approval does not also approve the prior application. Mr. Lawrence then clarified that his motion to approve the development plans for the new Hogrefe-Cooke

Building is to also include that the façade of the 119 E. Market St. building is maintained. All members were in favor of the motion, and the application was approved.

Staff updates/new business:

The next meeting is scheduled for August 19th, 2020.

Meeting adjourned:

Mr. Zuilhof made a motion to adjourn and Mr. Lawrence seconded the motion. The meeting ended at 5:28pm.

Approved by:

Kristen Barone, Clerk

Firmothy Berkey, Chairman