

**Dennis Murray called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after the Invocation, given by Dick Brady, and the Pledge of Allegiance.**

**The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine.**

**City staff present: Aaron Klein – Public Works Director, John Orzech – Police Chief, Rick Wilcox – Fire Chief, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Planning Director, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Don Rumbutis – IT, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Justin Harris - Law Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser–Commission Clerk.**

**Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve the minutes of the February 26 meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.**

### **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said there is legislation to spend \$39,000 for an art consultant which is divided into two parts (Item #4). The first is the art acquisition fund costing \$42,500 and the second is for planning, public art and special projects costing \$45,000 for a total of \$87,500. Sharon Johnson asked the difference between and functions of these two art programs and what kinds of art the city has in mind.

Dan Delahunt, 1025 Cedar Point Road, said property owners have not been given the petition for the Special Improvement District (SID) [Item #3] although he did obtain a copy of it and has some questions. Sometimes we have great programs similar to the street cleaning which the Sandusky Main Street Association did for approximately \$9,100 per year, but now we are looking at a property owner assessment which will generate about \$128,000, and asked how we get to a sixty percent majority to pass this. City-owned properties will be included in this district but does not know if this will be at the appraised value or the full market value; Erie County assesses using the taxable value which is 35% of the appraised value, but this legislation is based on full market value. When figuring out the tax and the assessment in different years, it is shown both by a percent of the total market value as opposed to the taxable market value. With this petition, it seems as if the cart is before the horse for the commission to approve it and then go to the property owners to see if there is interest.

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said there is a gentleman who does stone or metal sculptures from Kelley's Island and the city should work a deal with him to have these donated to the city for June, July and August in Washington Park. At the end of the year, anyone can come to the park to see them and they could be returned to him at the end of the year. The city could find an artist every summer to do the same thing. There are many volunteers in the area who help with gardens and parks who have the knowledge to create an art council to have items submitted for consideration by the city whether temporary or permanent. For the city to pay a company to tell us how and what to choose as art is ridiculous when this money could be used for the art.

### **PRESENTATION**

**Tiffany Taylor, GIS Coordinator**, said during the past year, we have published our ArcGIS Online with 132 individual feature layers, 75 maps, 30 web apps and 14 Survey123 which is available to all employees through the internet. A presentation was made to state officials during the State of the State Week at the Ohio GIS Conference in Columbus and the public tree inventory map was accepted into the Ohio Chapter URISA's online map gallery. Of particular note this past year has been the use of Survey123 across all departments of the city for various purposes such as for flushing and daily records, pothole survey, sweeping log, alleys, snow plow driver logs, leaf collection, the Downtown Sandusky grocery survey, voting for PRIDE awards, the Bicentennial Parade survey and most recently, the backflow field survey. All of these take paper forms and allow access via phones or tablets for data entry in the field. We are collecting all of this data

which goes back to a central location and statistics can be pulled for decision-making. This data is then converted to be viewed and used to make management decisions either in the field or in the office. In addition, they allow us to correspond with the public. As an example, a public survey was used when the recent closure of Kreimes Cardinal Grocery was announced. The staff in the Public Works Department have been instrumental in getting the GIS up and running and are the largest user for data collection within the city currently. The city has collected data related to all of the water meters, manholes, traffic lights, traffic signals, control boxes and street lighting which helps the city keep track of our assets for asset management as well as to comply with EPA mandates. Moving forward through this year, we will continue training across departments with management personnel and with field staff. We will continue collecting data for asset management and EPA compliance. We will expand Survey123, collector and dashboard applications and will increase the use of our ArcGIS day-to-day amongst management to allow them to see the big picture about what is going on in the field. Dick Brady said staff is very optimistic about the GIS program and how it will play a significant role in tracking work orders. The ultimate question is how this serves all of our residents and how it makes a better community. This helps by knowing where complaints come from, where workers are flowing to and how long it takes us to respond. Dennis Murray asked if our GIS is more instrumental in providing better services or in being more efficient and Tiffany Taylor said this drives us toward both. It allows staff to keep track of what they are doing and allows management to keep track of what, where and how things are being done by city staff. Dennis Murray said he finds this fascinating and would be appreciative to take the opportunity to take a deeper look at this at some point in time to understand how it is we are making decisions.

Amanda Golden, Managing Principal of Designing Local, said this is a cultural planning firm from Columbus, Ohio, focusing on historic preservation and culture in cities and how to build infrastructure to support funding and the longevity of arts and culture. Public art can change things from being mundane to interesting and exciting. Public art is also unexpected and Amanda Golden showed various pictures of iconic pieces in cities which help draw people to them. Public art can also be functional, can increase safety and enhance aesthetics. Public art creates interesting spaces and are a reason for people to want to stand in between buildings and has the power to express who the community believes they are and to draw people into the city to spend more money here. Designing Local will spend the next six to seven months with residents, city and elected officials asking what people hope Sandusky will become, what kinds of expressions and community value statements should be expressed through public art and will think about how to make this happen. There will be conceptual projects and programs to fund, but there will also be policy direction to establish a sound program. Money being spent on this plan must be done in a fiscally responsible manner for the future and adopting a plan and going through the process ensures this happens. There will be a maintenance policy adopted, a gifting policy to determine what is a good asset to take on when being donated and determine what kinds of things might need to come with the gift (maintenance endowment, etc.). There will also be some funding opportunities for public art and Sandusky is one of the first communities in Ohio to establish a mechanism for this. The plan will look at how else these opportunities can be funneled and will be as an opportunity to fund public art outside of this legislation including grant monies available through foundations and the federal government. Designing Local will spend a lot of time with the stakeholders and the public asking what they would like to see using trends and best practices in public art and public art planning as well as local solutions for the community. By September or October, a Master Plan will be completed and presented to the City Commission for adoption. Angela Byington said there is one source for public art funding and this is being used to fund this contract and future art projects. The other account mentioned is intended for special projects and planning, not for art. Dennis Murray said we are about to find out what kind of art Sandusky wants and nothing is yet planned. Wes Poole asked the process for getting this information. Amanda Golden said the process starts in April by asking different stakeholders to meet who will be asked about their vision for public art in Sandusky as well as for Sandusky in general. The stakeholders will also help them to understand how the public best interacts in a public meeting session. These meetings will be hosted at coffee shops, in a park or on a walk or other similar settings because creativity is best expressed in settings other than a traditional

public meeting. Concepts will be explored about different types of public art such as murals, sculpture, using historic buildings to showcase light, temporary shows or a sculpture-on-loan program. After all of this information is collected, Designing Local spends their time thinking about what the best conceptual projects and programs could be to fund. They will also be thinking about different policies which need to be put into place to maintain any public artworks commissioned by the city which is very important given the weather in Sandusky. People outside of the maintenance department need to know how often to come in and help with maintenance. If someone is donating a piece of art, future maintenance must be determined. All of this information becomes part of a Master Plan including policies, projects and programs as well as implementation steps to guide the program for the next five to ten years. Wes Poole asked who the stakeholders are and how this will take form. Amanda Golden said they get a general list of types of people including business owners, middle or high school students, commissioners and staff members of the city and members of the public who are involved in any type of arts and culture or anyone else who wishes to be involved. It will be up to staff to form this list. Dennis Murray said he was happy to hear about the maintenance piece as this has been a downfall in other cities and this is a great value. Amanda Golden said unfortunately some cities have found it cheaper to remove pieces of art rather than to maintain and fix them as they did not have policies and procedures in place to maintain them which is a sad oversight.

#### **PUBLIC HEARING**

**Hank Solowiej, Finance Director, said we budget** because there are endless demands for spending with a limited amount of resources, no different than what we face at home. We make decisions by prioritizing with the legislative body setting the policy to outline the overall goals and objectives. In January, 2016, the commission unanimously adopted the Bicentennial/Strategic Vision Plan which is used as a blueprint and ties back to everything we do. The five main priorities of this plan involve making Sandusky a vibrant city, a livable city, a connected city and a destination city in our Bicentennial year. This budget addresses all five priorities in the plan. Hank Solowiej said what is being presented tonight is a balanced general fund budget with the anticipation of adding to the general fund reserve at the end of the year. We are estimating our reserve to be at about twenty percent which falls within our target range. Highlights on revenues (over \$24 million – which is an all-time high) include modest increases to the revenue projections for income tax, admissions tax, lodging tax and on our investment income. Total general fund expenses are estimated to be close to the same amount but we are projecting an approximate \$46,000 surplus at year end at this time. The Audit/Finance Committee unanimously recommended approval of this general fund budget at their February meeting. This is a balanced budget which meets the goals and objectives of the strategic plan adopted in 2016 by the City Commission. Eric Wobser said modest changes to staffing levels are projected because staff have been added in the past few years. There are two new general fund positions new to this years' budget. The Youth Program Supervisor will help us to accomplish the livable city goal of the Bicentennial vision. This has historically been a seasonal/summer position but will now be employed year-round to build programs with other entities serving youth and children. A Housing Programs Director will be added to assist with the housing programs launched last week, the residential tax abatement program and other initiatives to build infill housing and promote home ownership in the city. It is getting to the point where staffing this with multiple positions has become untenable and to be a leader and keep up with the pace for the demand for our housing programs, these new positions will be filled. All positions included in this years' budget but not currently filled were included in last years' budget. The public art program is the only general fund program new to this years' budget. From a general fund perspective, this budget allows us to continue programs for neighborhood infrastructure including the park program, the sidewalk program, the tree program and local street resurfacing program which continue to benefit from the \$1.5 million transfer of general fund dollars to the capital budget. Dave Waddington asked about the service center debt coming off of the city's books in 2020 and the added 27<sup>th</sup> payroll during that year. Hank Solowiej said the payroll stabilization fund was created to set money aside which we will continue to do for this occurrence in 2020. The service center debt will fall off in 2020 and will free up some of the capacity for future projects the city will be undertaking. The city's bond rating for Moody's is AA3 and we had a very thorough rating review process and

analysts came into town for a very involved process. They were excited to see things going on here and our ratings show we are high quality. Wes Poole asked how much the service center debt is and Hank Solowiej said the annual debt service is around \$700,000. Wes Poole asked what this will be replaced with and how soon and Hank Solowiej said he does not know the answer. Wes Poole asked what the Justice Center costs will be and how this is being planned for. Dennis Murray said this has been discussed quite a bit in terms of where estimates are for the Justice Center. Eric Wobser said we are still in the process of analyzing the full cost for the Justice Center. Fifty percent of the Justice Center will be the responsibility of the Sandusky Municipal Court and will not come from our debt service so \$12 million is probably on the low end of the total project and Judge O'Brien will contribute toward this. City Hall is around \$6 million and the majority will be made through lease payments during the next seven years. This will not draw down on any debt service but when our option kicks in to purchase City Hall in 2027, the debt service could be used to offset these costs as well as the fire station debt. We still believe there is more debt rolling off than there are debt payments rolling on. Wes Poole asked if the court has any debt service currently and Hank Solowiej said they allocate a portion of their court costs to the capital fund so it is our assumption the money dedicated to this fund will be used for capital expenses for the future. Dennis Murray said Judge O'Brien has accumulated a large fund in anticipation of this and the thought is the bonds sold could be supported by the same payment stream to repay the debt. Wes Poole said what is important is we have a specific amount of debt service which put the city in a position where it had to lay-off employees and not take care of the community. Because we gave ourselves more money, we are now spending some of it very wisely, but by the time we finish borrowing money and/or making improvements to the Justice Center, the city building, and anything else which does not have a revenue-generating purchase, we will be back where we were when there was an economic downturn and started us down the path we were in in 2014. This caused us to raise our taxes and he wants to be sure it does not turn out this way again. We are indebting ourselves for projects even before our current debt rolls off. This will put us back in the same condition where we cannot protect ourselves and has concerns about ensuring the money we spend can sustain us. Dennis Murray said we have gone through this process when we looked at approving the City Hall and Justice Center plans and projected the debt payments. When all was said and done, the debt payments will be significantly less than what we are paying today and thinks we have a great deal of capacity. With the revenue stream and because of the additional economic activity in the area, we will be more than fine. There is a lot of talk about where the money comes from for capital projects but these are all funded through Tax Incremental Financing (TIF) and the five-year capital plan. These are not at all reliant on the general fund. Eric Wobser said the vast majority of the Jackson Street Pier, Shoreline Drive and the Sandusky Bay Pathway will be non-general fund monies. We are working hard to not have to debt finance the portion of the pathway not paid for with TIF monies. The TIF's being worked on appear strong from a revenue standpoint and will give us flexibility to strategically deploy the \$500,000 annually for the Sandusky Bay Pathway without needing to bond this for debt service. We will be in a much stronger and sustainable position as far as debt based on the stability of the real estate market and the continuing economic development and investment happening downtown as well as decisions made how projects are being funded which will allow debt to roll off going forward. Most importantly, we are being flexible as we spend dollars we are bringing in which is what the community wants us to do and we are doing so in a way which conditions change. Succession planning and deploying a significant amount of capital on an annual basis. Wes Poole said the public will be happy to know this is under control. Greg Lockhart said he is for a lot of these projects we are doing and thinks it is amazing we are moving forward at the rate we are. We have reduced from 340 or so employees and staffing is one of the first things he looks at. Safety Services are the most important thing we can think about and now the Fire Department is doing approximately 6,500 calls annually where it used to do 3,000 calls and we are using the same amount of manpower to do more work and is concerned we are not budgeting to add more Fire Fighters. Our first priority is the defense of our employees and wants staffing levels where they should be. During times of downturn, the first thing we look to do is lose staff and would like to see how this will be addressed for the future. Eric Wobser said we continue to monitor staffing levels in every department fully based on available funds and other factors. We have an unfilled Assistant Chief position to fill this year in the Fire Department as well

as four total employees in the Police Department (including three Police Officers); we feel adequately staffed in these areas but certainly will look to add resources as necessary. Safety, especially during periods of recession, is protected and Police and Fire will be the last two departments on the chopping block and we would look to other places first and ultimately only look to safety as necessary. Nikki Lloyd said this concern is valid and there have been a lot of discussions about debt roll-off and our full capacity and is why we are moving forward with compartmentalizing some of the Issue 8 funds. We have a lot of projects going on right now and in the future and we want to make sure we know where dollars are going and be realistic with our timelines. Wes Poole said he recognizes the numbers balance and we base expenditures on expected revenues. This reflects an increase in the Police Department's revenues by thirty percent and asked what is being done differently. Revenues went down this year by about \$52,000 and asked where they are coming from. Hank Solowiej said these are court fines and are not controlled by the Police Department. Wes Poole said this suggests the police did less this year. Fines being increased does not help the economy; rather it takes money out of the economy. Tourists now driving into town for five minutes in twenty mile per hour traffic and are not getting tickets. Ticketing adds an additional \$75,000 being taken from citizens pockets and we have much worse things going on in this community. The plan to make all of this work involves the Police Department moving resources toward writing more traffic tickets and does not support this. Additionally, there is a big jump with the marine patrol which works on weekends and a 30% increase in fines for them means harassment for boaters. This does not necessarily help the economy. Hank Solowiej said this is not all for fines as a large part of the Police Department's revenues are also for off-duty assignments which the city is reimbursed for. Hank Solowiej said he did not want to imply there are going to be more tickets written. Wes Poole said reimbursable money for the Police Department is money in/money out and asked how this impacts the \$24 million in revenue and Hank Solowiej said this comes off the bottom.

**The President asked if anyone wished to speak to the budget as presented; there being no comments, the President declared the Public Hearing closed.**

#### **CURRENT BUSINESS**

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.**

#### **REGULAR AGENDA**

##### **FIRST READING**

**ITEM #1 - Submitted by Hank Solowiej, Finance Director**

**FY 2018 GENERAL APPROPRIATIONS/CITY BUDGET**

**PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed making general appropriations for the fiscal year 2018.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.**

*Discussion:* Wes Poole said the information given does not show all of the projects and asked if the basketball courts at Jaycee Park are going to be improved this year. Eric Wobser said what is reflected in this budget is a \$1.5 million transfer from the general fund to the capital budget. The budget is still being put together for passage in April which will be more specific with this and other projects. Eric Wobser said he cannot point specifically where the basketball courts at Jaycee Park are but is a priority project for the neighborhood initiative and we are looking to do this sooner rather than later. We have set aside about \$300,000 for park projects in our five-year plan and the Jaycee Park courts are part of this. Wes Poole said this is generally nice to hear, but we have more canoe launch locations planned than adult full-court basketball courts for the entire community. Wes Poole said he has been waiting for this for too long and we are creating brand new ideas meant for tourists when the residents passed a tax increase to improve their lives and we are getting off-base.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.**

**ITEM #2 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works**

**DESIGN/BUILD CONTRACT WITH CORNERSTONE LANDSCAPING FOR PIPE CREEK WILDLIFE AREA FLOATING DOCK PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** The preliminary design and permitting was performed under a purchase order with Cornerstone Landscaping for \$1,850. Construction will be performed by Cornerstone Landscaping for \$40,890.72. Other materials like stone, rocks, signage and mulch that are purchased under separate purchase orders would be installed by city staff. All funds will be split between CDBG (\$25,000) and private donations (\$20,000). Total project costs will not exceed \$45,000.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-053:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a design/build contract with Cornerstone Landscaping, Inc., of Kent, Ohio, for the Pipe Creek Wildlife Area floating dock project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

*Discussion:* Aaron Klein said we have a six-year agreement with the Sandusky Bay Rowing Association which started in 2013. Their former facility was a lot worse than what they have now and the conditions of the area around it are wonderful for a park, but are not conducive to hauling kayaks, skulls, canoes or other types of boats to the launch area. With the high water this year, the mats were undermined and a lot of it eroded and made for difficult conditions from which to launch boats. The Rowing Association members approached the city indicating interest in a floating dock at this location and said they would be interested in donating money. Initially, they built a pole barn with their funds and within the past year, they have \$10,000 along with another \$10,000 from an anonymous donor to give to this project. The total project cost is about \$45,000 and the dock cost is just over \$40,000; \$25,000 will come from CDBG.

Lindsey Schilling, President of the Sandusky Bay Rowing Association, said the mats along the shore were installed last year and helped to cover the glass along the shoreline for a smoother transition into the water; however, they are very slippery. Most of the members are older and sometimes are in waist deep water or higher depending on water levels and must then hoist themselves into the shell and this can be difficult. Aaron Klein said the area has been a focus for Friends of Pipe Creek as well cleaning up glass and other materials and it is good to have something like this close to the Sandusky Bay Pathway. The materials being provided are versatile and additional sections can be added if necessary or replaced if ever damaged. We are also looking at signage and other things so motorized vehicles cannot utilize this ramp. Dennis Murray thanked the Sandusky Bay Rowing Association members for the fundraising efforts and said it is great to have this gift to make this area available for the entire public to use. Wes Poole said this is a good project and asked if the approach will be done nicely as well. Aaron Klein said this project is for the dock only and we hope to purchase some stone or mulch if there is money left for a pathway leading to the dock. We do not have funding to do the concrete ramp and the Pipe Creek Wildlife area is a location for future planning efforts. There will be future projects at the site and anticipates one of them will be a ramp to the dock at some point. Dave Waddington said he would like to get the pathway area paved and on April 21 there will be a cleanup in this area with the Friends of Pipe Creek. Wes Poole said he is difficult and picky about what we spend money on and may not always agree, but believes as a matter of planning we need to do it right the first time and hates mediocrity. Doing a little bit of something everywhere makes a whole lot of people somewhat happy but we are competing with all of the communities on Lake Erie and we need to put high quality into every project we do and is not satisfied with low hanging fruit and just getting by and saying it is better than it was before. As soon as possible, this needs

to be made a place where people want to go to launch and if this means doing fewer projects, this is fine.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

#### **FIRST READING**

**ITEM #3 - Submitted by Greg Voltz, Assistant Planner**

#### **PETITION TO CREATE DOWNTOWN SANDUSKY SPECIAL IMPROVEMENT DISTRICT**

**Budgetary Information:** There is no budgetary impact in authorizing the City Manager to sign the Petition on behalf of the City of Sandusky.

**PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested a resolution be passed approving the Petition and authorizing and directing the City Manager to execute the Petition for creation of the Downtown Sandusky Special Improvement District under Ohio Revised Code, Chapter 1710.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to approve this resolution at first reading.**

*Discussion:* Angela Byington said this request is to approve the city signing a petition to create a Special Improvement District (SID); it is not to approve it. A SID would create a revenue source for ongoing maintenance and for programming in the downtown. This vote would not have a fiscal impact on the city's budget.

Alan Griffiths, Downtown Sandusky, Inc. said they have been working on this for nearly 18 months and are in the process of petitioning property owners in the district and the petition contains a map of the proposed district borders. Based on initial canvassing of property owners who would likely be sympathetic, they are pleased with the success and are pleased with the number of property owners who have signed petitions or given verbal commitments to participate. They are confident this process will be successful pending this commission vote as the year progresses. They will continue to petition for the next month or so and there is a legislative process to come back before the commission to create the district later this year if the threshold of sixty percent is met by the property owners. The SID would be implemented later this year with funds coming in April, 2019 via revenue collections. The intention is to petition the majority of property owners there is not a requirement to petition every property owner. They started this process by going to property owners who were already sympathetic to the process. As they proceed, they will continue to have a broader discussion. The city's participation is a major piece of this and wanted to come to the commission early to understand their views before going out more broadly to others in the community.

Shannon Fergus, Fergus Consulting, said they are working on front footage rather than square footage as this is easier to track and it is easier to gather this information. Market value is being used as this is an assessment, not a tax. When trying to decide what property owners would like to see in terms of an assessment and what would be acceptable to pay on a yearly basis, they used the taxable value starting between five and ten percent. When presented within the plan, it was written as total market value. Regardless of whether a property is abated, they will be assessed on the full value.

Wes Poole said we are supposed to be receiving a petition from property owners but does not believe the city should be signing onto this before we know what we are signing on to. The concept of the city signing a petition which was supposed to have come from the property owners is inappropriate. If they simply want to understand the commissions' position, this is one thing; we are looking at the city to pass the petition. Justin Harris said as a municipality, the city is a parcel owner of multiple parcels in downtown. The city has to sign off on participating by

voting to sign the petition and saying “yes” or “no” as a downtown tenant. We can sign the petition but if they do not reach sixty percent, it will never come back to the city. After they reach sixty percent, the petition will come back to the city to create the district and start the assessment. Signing this petition says the city supports this as good for downtown. Each property owner should take responsibility and this is a way to get the folks downtown to say the Clean and Safe program cost will be shared by those who will benefit from it. Wes Poole said we do not have a district, this will be made up later and there is only a drawing of where it might be. At the end of the day, we should be signing onto a petition based on what is presented by the other property owners. The city is about thirty percent of this particular district and does not think we should have such a heavy thumb on a law written to allow property owners the opportunity to tax themselves before we jump onboard as a taxpayer. The taxpayers who have already paid to clean up downtown and do the things written in the Petition are now going to chip in again, or twice. This group should not get two bites of an apple from the taxpayers. Justin Harris said we voted and allocated a bigger chunk toward the Clean & Safe program in 2017; once the SID is approved, it will drop to \$2,900 and this will save taxpayer money. Wes Poole asked as a property owner of frontage, if the city pay the same as other property owners and Justin Harris said it is proportionate. Wes Poole said this is tax money which will come from the general fund and asked why we would pay twice as the general fund already picks up trash, shovels snow and waters flowers downtown. Eric Wobser said this commission voted last year to make a grant of \$50,000 to participate in the creation of a pilot program for Clean & Safe for downtown Sandusky. We now foresee this grant being unnecessary and on an annual basis, we will be contributing approximately \$2,900. The commission had already voted in agreeing on the premise of what Clean & Safe could provide as far as increased property values and investment and will save about \$47,000 per year from what we have already invested into this process and this is a significant savings. Downtown continues to attract significant investment unlike other places with a singular donor who builds a rate into the rent of these facilities for maintenance, cleaning and programming. This is foreseen by the Block by Block program in a downtown with over 120 property owners where this process does not exist. This is why, in the 1970’s, downtowns were being killed by malls and business districts were created to protect them from their inability to control the experience for residents. We would be paying \$2,900 per year to ensure or to protect the investment. We have had over 30 businesses open downtown in the last three years and these are well-spent investments which disproportionately provide more tax revenue than then they siphon from the city for services in the downtown area. Wes Poole said if the downtown business owners had come to the city with these signatures, he would have no objection to participating. This process is one which has been too heavy handed and driven by the city with a law intended for the property owners themselves initiate. Now the city has gotten involved and we have too much money and cover too much property and is concerned with the 40% who are not interested. We have some people with big pockets who own significant amounts of property downtown who can make up the 60% but when the city is thrown into this, all of a sudden the people who may not be interested are going to be pushed into it. Not to mention, once the city starts passing the petition, with the grant monies we hold, we are the big bully on the street. The implication is the city is pushing this onto these folks. Dennis Murray said his firm has been presented with this Petition and will abstain from voting. Greg Lockhart asked for clarification as to how this will improve the downtown which is relatively clean and safe. Downtown Sandusky is unique and has been relatively free of graffiti and other things. Alan Griffiths said they have received significant feedback from downtown residents, business owners and property owners over the years who agree the downtown is relatively clean most of the time, but there are particular times when it gets dirty and is used heavily. As we are seeing economic growth in downtown, this use increases dramatically. There has been a lot of concern expressed about late night activities which impact the ability to do things on Saturday or Sunday mornings. There will be a trial of the Clean & Safe program starting in May and people will be able to see the absolute benefits. Chris Parthemore with the State Theatre has expressed his glee he will not personally have to power wash sidewalks outside of the theatre on a Saturday morning in order to get ready for a show on Saturday evening. They will also be able to provide a visible point of contact with a team of four people who will be downtown on a daily basis checking in with them, acting as a liaison with city services, with the Police, Fire and others and also being able to provide feedback



and input to Downtown Sandusky, Inc. as to how they can assist more on a daily basis. They will be providing visitors with a visible presence to answer questions, give direction and help find places to eat, drink or rest at peak tourist times. In Cleveland, Ohio City has a high profile presence for people on the street which is a huge potential advantage. The city and greenhouse does a wonderful job but there is a lot of room for additional support downtown and this is a way for them to contribute. They have spent a lot of time talking with property owners and the vast majority of major property owners do support this initiative because they can see the clear benefit to them and to their tenants as downtown will be serviced to a much higher standard than it has been in the past. Dick Brady asked if there was a timing issue with not rolling this out after experiencing a very successful Clean & Safe program this spring. Alan Griffiths said there were sequencing issues around the passage of legislation in the fall so the process of getting petitions signed had to be postponed. There is a six month delay by the time funds are set aside to the time the SID is set up and it was determined to start the trial program this year to allow more time for the petitioning process. Dick Brady said we have some very good downtown property owners; unfortunately this is not the case with every property owner and this is a tax on them. This is meant to benefit everyone overall and not be duplicitous with services and believes this will provide a cleaner downtown at a very low cost. Nikki Lloyd said she will abstain as she was approached with the petition and expressed her extreme frustration with the Ohio Ethics Commission for not being permitted to give her opinion on items she cannot vote on.

**Roll call on the resolution: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart and Naomi Twine, 4. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. Abstain: Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, 2. The President declared the resolution passed at first reading.**

#### **FIRST READING**

**ITEM #4 - Submitted by Greg Voltz, Assistant Planner**

#### **AGREEMENT WITH DESIGNING LOCAL FOR PUBLIC ART MASTER PLAN**

**Budgetary Information:** The proposed agreement with Designing Local for professional services is to be \$39,925 and will be paid from the Public and Cultural Art & Acquisition fund referenced in Chapter 187.

**PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement for professional services with Designing Local, Ltd., of Columbus, Ohio, for the Public Art Master Plan.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading. Roll call on the ordinance: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.**

**ITEM #5 - Submitted by Jane Cullen, Project Engineer**

#### **WEST MARKET STREET SEWER REPLACEMENT PROJECT - CONTRACT AWARD WITH RISING SON COMPANY**

**Budgetary Information:** The estimated cost of the project based on bids including engineering, inspection, advertising and miscellaneous costs is \$71,930.10 will be paid with sewer funds.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-054:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Rising Son Company, LLC, of Mansfield, Ohio, for the West Market Street sewer replacement project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

*Discussion:* Aaron Klein said this is to replace 290 linear feet of sewer in terrible shape and under maintenance on a regular basis on the far west end of Market Street between Shelby and Pearl Streets. This is too deep for our equipment and crews to do the work and is the second time the

project has been put out for bid. This project came in at just over \$65,000 and is scheduled to be done by the end of July. Dick Brady said in 2011 when he first served on the City Commission, Dave Waddington explained this section of sewer was put in when Lincoln was still walking on the earth and thinks it is about time we get it repaired.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**ITEM #6 - Submitted by Jane Cullen, Project Engineer**

**VENICE ROAD PUMP STATION IMPROVEMENTS PROJECT – CONTRACT AWARD WITH K.E. MCCARTNEY & ASSOCIATES**

**Budgetary Information:** The estimated amount of the consultant fee for contract administration and inspection services is not to exceed \$95,036 and will be paid with sewer funds.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-055:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement for professional services with K.E. McCartney & Associates, Inc., of Mansfield, Ohio, for contract administration and inspection services for the Venice Road pump station improvements project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**ITEM #7 - Submitted by Jane Cullen, Project Engineer**

**GARTLAND AVENUE RECONSTRUCTION PROJECT – AMENDMENT TO AGREEMENT WITH RICHLAND ENGINEERING LIMITED**

**Budgetary Information:** The current cost of the professional design services for the Gartland Avenue reconstruction project is \$86,845 with \$55,845 to be paid from sewer funds and \$31,000 to be paid with water funds. The additional work required an additional fee of \$8,420 which would be paid from sewer funds in the amount of \$5,919 and water funds in the amount of \$2,501. The revised professional design agreement not to exceed amount would then be \$95,265.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-056:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an amendment to the agreement for professional design services with Richland Engineering Limited of Mansfield, Ohio, for the Gartland Avenue reconstruction project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

*Discussion:* Aaron Klein said during construction, there was significant flooding on the corner of Jefferson and Huron Streets which is immediately adjacent to Gartland Avenue and wanted to make sure to take care of this while in the area. The two water lines on Huron and Gartland were both dead end water lines so while doing design work, they looped these water lines so if there ever is a water main break, the city can continue to service the residents.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on**

**the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**ITEM #8 - Submitted by Todd Gibson, Properties & Facilities Superintendent  
RENTAL & SERVICE AGREEMENT FOR PORTABLE RESTROOMS IN CITY PARKS WITH GARNER SANITATION**

**Budgetary Information:** The total cost of this contract for years 2018 – 2020 is \$47,450. The cost of the rental and service of the portable restrooms will be paid with general funds and recreation funds based on the usage (number of service times and the restroom size) and location. All costs have been included in the contractual services portions of the operation and maintenance budgets for the respective departments. This agreement may be amended if additional units are needed in the future.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-057:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a three year agreement with Garner Sanitation Service, Inc., of Sandusky, Ohio, for the rental and service of portable restrooms in city parks; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

*Discussion:* Dennis Murray said this appears to be a lot of money, but it is for a three-year period. He had not realized how many locations there are in the city where port-a-potties are located and when looking at the list, he has seen them but had never tallied them. Aaron Klein said last year, the contract was just under \$10,000 but included other locations such as the Shelby Street boat launch. This year, because of inflation and because of the \$10,000 threshold, we grouped everything together. Last year the city spend just over \$13,000 so this is a \$2,400 increase and we added one location and removed two. We also asked for a unit price to utilize additional units if needed for Bicentennial or other events.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**ITEM #9 - Submitted by Stuart Hamilton, IT Manager and Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works  
SOFTWARE UPGRADE FOR WASTE WATER TREATMENT PLANT**

**Budgetary Information:** The cost for this purchase will not exceed \$65,856 and will be paid by the sewer fund. If approved, this expenditure will be included in the 2018 capital improvements plan.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-058:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement for professional services with Rovisys, of Aurora, Ohio, for the Wonderware supervisory control and data acquisition software at the Waste Water Treatment Plant; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

*Discussion:* Stuart Hamilton said this is another case where lack of investment over the years is catching up with us. This project will bring SCADA software up to date to be more stable and secure. This enables an HMI system product across the plant where we currently have multiple products. Moving to single product enables easier support and training for the plant operators.

This is one stage in a bigger project to bring the plants up to date and we have already updated the hardware and now are moving to the logical portion starting with the Waste Water Treatment Plant. Eventually, we will take this to the Water Plant so it is consistent across the city. These projects are not possible without support of the plant staff and usually are painful but seldom succeed without the plant staff who have been amazing throughout this project to this point. Stuart Hamilton said computers throughout the plant control the hardware to let the plant function. The old software has limited functionality and is not stable and this is all being brought up to date with the latest bells and whistles and bringing consistent support and stability back to the plant. Dennis Murray said if we do not make this investment, we are at risk of not being able to operate. Stuart Hamilton said we are functional, but we are at risk and are very far behind. Dick Brady said we are going to spend this same amount of money at Big Island Water Works for software and lobbied Stuart Hamilton to get this into a budget as early as next year. There is nothing more important than reliable software to run both of these plants as they are responsible for the life and safety of almost every resident in Erie County.

**Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**ITEM #10 - Submitted by John Orzech, Police Chief**

**PURCHASE OF 2018 CHEVY TRAVERSE FROM NATIONAL AUTO FLEET GROUP**

**Budgetary Information:** The cost for the vehicles is \$32,455.48 which will be paid for with federal forfeiture funds.

**ORDINANCE NO. 18-059:** It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring a 2006 Chrysler 300 as unnecessary and unfit for city use pursuant to Section 25 of the city charter; authorizing and directing the City Manager to purchase a 2018 Chevy Traverse from National Auto Fleet Group of Watsonville, California, for the Police Department; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Wes Poole, Nikki Lloyd and Naomi Twine, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.**

**CITY MANAGER'S REPORT**

- Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept a \$50 donation for the Police Department Trust Fund in memory of Andy Dunn who was killed in the line of duty on March 19, 2011, from the Solowiej Family. The President declared the motion passed.
- Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept a \$430 donation to the Kenny Jensen Memorial Tree Fund from various employees. The President declared the motion passed.
- Upon motion of Wes Poole and second of Dick Brady, the commission voted to accept two in-kind donations (\$400 value/donor) from two local companies which contributed to the restoration of the Boy with the Boot. American Quality Stripping of Sandusky provided the paint stripping process and Powertrip Motorsports of Huron provided the powder coating. The President declared the motion passed.

- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to accept two \$10,000 donations, one from the Sandusky Bay Rowing Association and another from an Anonymous donor, for the floating docks in the Pipe Creek Wildlife area. The President declared the motion passed.**
- The City of Sandusky is offering **full testing services for the position of Police Officer through National Testing Network, Inc.** The testing period is April 9, 2018, through May 31, 2018. To fill out an application and schedule a written test, go to: [www.nationaltestingnetwork.com](http://www.nationaltestingnetwork.com), select Law Enforcement and sign up for the Sandusky Police Department. Registration must be done prior to reporting to the testing facility. The closest testing locations to Sandusky are EHOVE Career Center and Owens Community College.
- **The seventh anniversary of the line of duty death of Officer Andrew Dunn**, killed on March 19, 2011, is approaching. Please keep his family in your thoughts and prayers.
- Over the last two weeks, **Chaplain John Adams presented a program, “Emotional Survival for Law Enforcement”** to Police Officers who have been hired in 2015 until present and opened the program to other law enforcement agencies. The course topics deal with handling emotional trauma for the officers and their families and we appreciate Chaplain Adams’ time in teaching the officers on this topic.
- **Chief Wilcox and Fire Marshall Rucker will be delivering meals “Meal on Wheels”** alongside of Senior Center volunteers the week of March 12
- The next scheduled **Audit/Finance Committee** meeting is March 23 at 7:45 a.m.
- Many divisions will be seeking several hard-working and motivated **seasonal and part-time employees** and applications are available in the Human Resources office.
- Please call 419.627.5829 for reservations for **palm and fern rentals**. Staff has already begun accepting reservations for Good Friday, Easter and graduations, so please plan ahead.
- Congratulations to **Matt Wilson for his promotion to Foreman and Matt Weltle for his promotion to Maintenance III within the Water Distribution Division.**
- Per Section 531 of the codified ordinances, no owner or occupant of real property within the city shall permit their **grass or weeds to grow above 8 inches in height**. The city published the annual required notice in the [Sandusky Register](#) on March 1 notifying all property owners of the grass cutting ordinance and future steps the city will undertake to ensure compliance with the applicable codes. Effective January 1, 2016, revisions to the ordinance took effect whereby owners of both vacant properties and vacant lots will not be provided a second notice of violation as was historically the case.

#### **OLD BUSINESS**

None.

#### **NEW BUSINESS**

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Greg Lockhart, the commission voted to hold a second Public Hearing on April 23 at 5 p.m. regarding the city’s FY 2018 CDBG program. The President declared the motion passed.**

Dennis Murray said the **Sandusky Landmarks Commission** was created to consider and make recommendations for inclusion of properties designated as Landmarks within the City of Sandusky. Since its establishment last year, members of the Sandusky Planning Commission have

served on this commission. Membership specifically requires city residents who are professionals or have expertise in architecture, history, planning, archaeology or related disciplines to the extent available. Meetings are held, at a minimum, at least four times per year and persons who are interested are encouraged to contact the Commission Clerk, Kelly Kresser, via email: [kkresser@ci.sandusky.oh.us](mailto:kkresser@ci.sandusky.oh.us), or telephone 419.627.5850.

#### **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked if the city's portion for the Special Improvement District will be \$2,900 and Dennis Murray said it will be approximately this amount. Sharon Johnson said the city gave a \$500,000 match grant for the pathway drive but is not sure if the city owns this land. Dennis Murray said this was covered at the last meeting and the city does own it either outright or via easement. Sharon Johnson said Items #3 and #4 were listed as first reading and asked if the commissioners were discussing their votes before the meetings. Dennis Murray said these are put on as first reading as they are significant pieces of legislation and we want to provide ample time for the commission and public to consider them. Justin Harris said the city charter requires all legislation not passed under emergency or Section 13 to be passed with two readings.

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, asked what will happen if the city is not part of the sixty percent wishing to participate in the Special Improvement District. In Amherst all of the business owners are responsible to clean up their properties and they work together with the city. If businesses cannot keep their outside areas clean, they should not be allowed to have tables on the sidewalk. There will be a person to direct tourists through this program but the city just spent a lot of money on signage to tell people where restaurants and other attractions are and this is an exorbitant amount of money. Vermilion has volunteers who take care of their downtown and hanging baskets as well as over 40 persons who clean up the beach every morning. They also raised money to restore the lighthouse and replace the lens. When 200 underage students are brought in along with staff, teachers and waste management and cafeteria workers, Kathryn Carter asked how many Police Officers will be permanently hired full-time to take care of the Put-In-Bay situation the city is trying to create.

**At 6:58 p.m., upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to adjourn. The President declared the motion passed.**

---

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC  
Commission Clerk

---

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.  
President of the City Commission