

Dennis Murray called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after the Invocation, given by Naomi Twine, and the Pledge of Allegiance.

The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd.

City staff present: Aaron Klein – Public Works Director, John Orzech – Police Chief, Rick Wilcox – Fire Chief, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Planning Director, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Don Rumbutis – IT, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Justin Harris - Law Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser–Commission Clerk.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve the minutes of the March 9 meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Anthony Harris, 1329 Avondale, said charcoal and woodchips are plant products and there is no barbequing allowed in the parks but understands smoking will be allowed at Mills Creek Golf Course; this is also a city park. People who ride a bicycle on the bike path cannot smoke a cigarette, cigar or pipe, and obviously they cannot drive a car along the designated path marked on the street. Anthony Harris asked what will happen with the flood of calls which will take place from smokers who see others who smoke and asked how the police will respond. Smokers pay sales tax on cigarettes which helps to maintain and pay for our parks and based on this, asked if people who buy cigarettes will be exempt from the tax as they are unable to use these areas. People will not be able to smoke in their vehicles or in park areas and for health and safety reasons, goose feces is a health and safety concern for kids running in the park. Tourists who come down in their vehicles and step out to smoke a cigarette will be affected. There is pollution from the coal docks wafting across the parks and piers. If a homeowner has a driveway next to a park, they will not be able to smoke a cigarette according to this ordinance as well as in parks with only greenspace and at bus stops. Bars areas with iron fences around them will allow smoking even though they are in close proximity to sidewalks. People will be unable to smoke outside restaurants such as the new Feick Building and people will not be able to smoke there as it is near ingress or egress of a public facility. People fishing at the pier will have to leave to smoke elsewhere and people who fish are usually doing so for a few hours. This was not well thought out and there was not a public hearing to discuss this ordinance before proposing to ban smoking in city parks.

Barb Linden, Muirwood Village, said rights are being violated at Muirwood Village. Six years ago, residents were convinced to take a separate payment plan and they found out it was a scam and ended up paying double for electric and had to pay to get out of the plan. Two weeks ago, they came to her door and she was told they had permission from the city to talk to residents and they have put “No Solicitation” signs on their doors and asked if they have to continue to put up with this. Dennis Murray suggested speaking to the city’s law director about this issue.

Yolanda Churchwell, 1126 Buckingham Street, said she is a non-smoker and is allergic to smoke, but is opposed to the proposed smoking ban in all of the open areas identified as this leads to interpretation of the law and the implementation. She is opposed to the process in which laws are proposed and passed and believes the commission is supposed to be a body of people who represent the citizens of Sandusky but this is not what is occurring. Whether for or against this law, it is a smaller symptom of the larger problem. Not a single commissioner contacted her or anyone she has spoken with regarding this law, but a decision she personally believes can lead to a negative effect in the dynamic of this city and relationships between its citizens and the police and the commissioners is taking place. She does not want to see Sandusky turned into a police state or become a hot bucket of angry, frustrated citizens and police who fear one another. This process, specifically this law, hurts our city and its growth in so many ways and believes in its current state, our commission is not working for the people who elected them.

The commission should focus on issues the citizens deem important and crucial to our well-being and growth and would like them to reach out to the citizens to see what it is they want done rather than a select group of people moving forward with laws which can cause confusion in disrespectful ways among citizens.

Michael Green, 1615 Pierce Street, said people who do not stand for something will fall for anything and it starts with one thing which leads to everything and then you have nothing. He is a taxpayer and a smoker, but this is not just about being attacked as a smoker, he is being attacked as a taxpayer. Smoking taxes should be written off as exempt and his rights are being violated. Commissioners were put in place to do a job and they have bigger issues than cigarettes such as our streets, drug problems and alleys needing to be cleaned. Exhaust from a car will kill someone faster than a cigarette and asked if people will be told to buy electric cars.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said there are two Tax Incremental Financing (TIF's) on the agenda and are for thirty years at one hundred percent. There are a total of 40 properties between the two being taken off the real estate rolls for taxes and is disappointed the Sandusky City Schools have allowed this as we do not usually do this anymore and thirty years is a long time. The schools will be losing out on 40 properties and asked who will make up for this. There are fourteen city parcels on this list and the city does not pay property taxes and asked if this is a land swap.

Birdea McCartney, 1305 Cleveland Road, asked what will happen to smokers coming into town for events and said tickets cannot be given to everyone. This creates a problem for smokers as they are being told what they can and cannot do. She disagrees with the commissioners who voted for this smoking ban in the downtown area and in our parks.

Jeff Berquist, 629 Edgewater Drive, said he has lived through some of the best and some of the worst times the city has had and in today's newspaper he sees we have problems with opiates, heroin, and breaking and entering but smoking is nowhere in it. We have roads and infrastructure which borderline third world countries and empty houses which the banks have not foreclosed upon. He asked about Ohio Bike Week and other festivals and how the smoking ban will be enforced when we are paying over \$500,000 in overtime to the Police and Fire Departments because of being under-manned. Most fire trucks leave with two personnel, one running the engine and one running the hose, but no one running into the buildings. Other festivals may decide to move out of town if people are no longer allowed to smoke and asked where this will stop. Dogs are allowed on outside patios but people are allergic to dogs, they have fleas and ticks, but they are permitted. The tip of the iceberg is not what sunk the Titanic, it is what was under the water and asked what is under the water if the smoking ban goes through. The last line states the city has the authority to change, manipulate and alter the smoking law. He does not smoke in his car nor in his house and does not smoke in his day care business, but one right goes after another. In Germany, Hitler first took the guns, then the gypsies, then the retarded and no one said a word; then he said they would go after those who were physically handicapped and no one said a word. When they came for the Jews, there was no one left to talk for them. We all need to talk about this issue.

Alan Griffiths, 1231 Wayne Street, commended the commission on the smoking ordinance and said it is an excellent public health message for citizens and especially to young people. The third graders at Sandusky Central Catholic School think this is a great idea and when asked to propose legislation of their own, they wanted to ban all smoking in the entire city with a \$1,000 fine for offenders.

Ryan Whaley, 316 East Water Street, commended the five commissioners for the smoking ban and said it makes him know they are doing their jobs and doing them correctly. This is a hot button issue and there is some backlash and this is not being utilized as a political move; they are doing it because they know it is better for the city and better for the future.

Laurie Kriss, 1334 Fifth Street, said people do not respect people who smoke and move away but it is their (smokers) right to smoke. Smoking has been taken away in restaurants and bars but there are more problems with alcohol and people like to have their drinks and food. There are more calls to the bars and this right should not be taken away.

Rich Carruthers, 2133 Remington Avenue, said this is the first time in his 64 years he has come to a commission meeting to voice his opinion and it is not an easy thing to do as he is totally disabled. The people he voted for decided to put in things they never spoke about when running for election. He never said he wanted someone to tell him he cannot smoke in his car which he pays for. Things are being taken away from the disabled in this town and there is a difference between disabled and handicapped and it is really hard on disabled people. The commission is here to represent him and others in the community, not to make decisions for them.

Tom LaMarca, 206 48th Street, said overall the commissioners do a pretty good job for our city and appreciates everything they do, but are jumping the gun on the smoking ban in parks and piers. When a family comes in from out of the area to take their kids fishing and want to have a cigarette, they should have the right to do that. He is a non-smoker and smoking is offensive to him, but does not begrudge others for doing so and it is the wrong direction to go. One group of people should not be directing the commission and forcing the city to do something they might regret down the road. Some of this goes back to Stalin and Hitler with the way in which this has been done and thinks it is wrong.

Patricia Berling, 215 East Shoreline Drive, #506, said she is a smoker and smoking is prohibited in her building but people in electric wheelchairs can only get to the parks and their right to smoke in them is being taken away. A bigger concern is houses where drug addicts go with syringes, dirty condoms and people sleeping in outhouses in the parks because they are not being manned. She lost a nephew and other family members are addicted to drugs and this is a bigger concern than smoking at this point in life.

Casey Jacobs, 606 Wayne Street, said she is in support of the smoking ban and believes it would lead to a cleaner and a safer environment for the children of the community. She walks to the park all the time with her children and it is frustrating when she feels like she cannot stay because of the risk of inhaling secondhand smoke for her or her son and supports the ban for these reasons. There are also a lot of cigarette butts being thrown into the water and this will help to eliminate some of that as well.

Kathryn Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said we all know the demons of smoking, but to her this is about cigarette butts and we do not have places to throw them. Cigarette butts pile up on the curb and on the pier and the new plan for the Jackson Street Pier does not include a curb. No one will get fined for littering on the pier and without a curb which is never picked up with a street sweeper, butts will end up in the lake and will turn into pollution which cities can get into trouble for. The trash cans should also be emptied regularly and this is more about what this is for. One can walk away from or sit on the other side of the park if someone is smoking and understands people being concerned about their kids, but there is a lot of room in the parks and picking and choosing steps on people's throats and is not what the commission was elected to do.

Marcie Platte, 1217 Columbus Avenue, knows people are concerned about the smoking issue but two commissioners said the reason they were voting for the ban was for children yet neither one said anything when Aaron Klein said there would not be sidewalks at the new school. The sidewalks will start in 2020 and the school is set to be built by 2019. There is no crosswalk on Campbell Street to get to the school and for people who are so concerned about children, the ball was dropped. This is the kind of thing citizens voted the commissioners in to do with extra levy money. Everyone wants to find the person who is smoking but asked what the city will do about the businesses. By law, every business has to have signage indicating where to call if their business is in violation or face a \$100 fine and asked what the commission is going to do to ask

their businesses in downtown to do the legal thing by putting signage up. Cedar Point is building so their people never have to leave their grounds to eat or drink. Their kids will play at the new Sports Force and will go back to the Cedar Point bars to eat and drink. Cedar Point has never fulfilled the first part which is a trail to the city area for part one of Sports Force and would like to see them do this. She does not see any public parking in the plans for persons to park and launch a canoe; Sandusky people will end up with the Pipe Creek area yet are the ones to help foot the bill and giving them the land. We have already given them a significant amount of money to start.

Carol Hey, 1024 Hayes Avenue, said as of 2009, the federal excise tax was \$1.01 and ten years later, it is going up again. This money goes for the federal government to fund the state children's health insurance program administered by the Department of Health & Human Services. Congress created the program in 1997 to expand health care coverage for uninsured children. This helps people who are ineligible for Medicaid and Congress twice tried to expand the program but was unsuccessful. States and local governments also have levied taxes on cigarettes for various purposes. In February, 2009, President Obama passed a bill which provided a \$.62 raise in taxes on a pack of cigarettes which brought the total cigarette tax to \$1.01 per pack median nationwide. Rhode Island charges the highest for the state at \$3.46 per pack; South Carolina charges the least at \$.07 per pack and the District of Columbia is \$1.18. States have often increased taxes on cigarettes in an attempt to generate revenue to help reduce their budget deficits and use the monies for roads, education, health care, prisons and infrastructure projects. Her late husband passed after serving in Vietnam because of alcohol and we keep expanding liquor in this city and would appreciate it if the commission would not mess with taxes and allow people to smoke; they are not smoking in people's faces and this is taking away their rights.

Roger Gundlach, 910 Columbus Avenue, said Gundlach Sheet Metal Works has been in the heart of Sandusky for 125 years. Three years ago, they decided to continue to be part of the renaissance of Sandusky with cooperation from the city rather than relocating to an industrial facility outside of the city thanks to the commissioners and to their neighbors. Item #4 is legislation for Gundlach's to support their growth which has been consistent for over 40 years and has increased in the past three years. They will improve the safety of the company for loading and unloading trucks on Columbus Avenue during busy times of the day. In addition, they have removed several abandoned houses with the neighbor's cooperation through sale of parcels to expand lot lines.

Tim Schwanger, 362 Sheffield Way, said when the smoking ban was discussed at a meeting on Saturday afternoon at the UAW Hall, the three commissioners who attended the Coffee With Commissioner did not attend. At this meeting, about 50 residents attended and they decided they will attempt to repeal this after the vote tonight and will also attempt to repeal Issue 8, the income tax increase. Tim Schwanger said Mills Creek Golf Course, the Sandusky Bay Pavilion and the Paper District have been exempted from the smoking ban and does not know if there might be some protectionism going on with this; this obviously will be a selective enforcement issue which is unfortunate. He asked if the Police Department or Code Enforcement will police the ban. Ryan Whaley told him (Tim) he picked up 500 cigarette butts in Shoreline Park this weekend and we do not have cigarette butt receptacles nor do today's vehicles have ashtrays and asked what people are supposed to do with them. There is one cigarette butt receptacle in Shoreline Park and it is outside of the 25' ordinance currently on the books; there is no problem with this restriction and children on the play equipment will not be impacted.

Robin Hudnall, 511 West Washington Street, said she is a downtown business owner and stands in support of the smoking ban. She is a smoker and a veteran of the United States Army. If there is no smoking in the parks, the city will not have to spend money for cigarette butt receptacles. As far as rights, she is a smoker but asked whose rights are being talked about. Rights of a parent and rights of our children are being taken away and when the wind is blowing, smoke can get to her children. The commissioners are protecting the rights of our children and our future. As a

smoker, she would be heartbroken to find out any one of her four children start smoking. The commissioners are not saying people cannot smoke, they are saying our children should not be exposed. We should provide the cleanest possible environment while they are at our parks. She believes in the future of our children and wanting what is best for them; the future of this community and this purpose outweighs the importance of her horrible addiction to smoking.

Nancy O'Rork, 523 Hancock Street, said she totally agrees with the 25' restriction currently on the books for the smoking ban. She is confused as to why there are exceptions to the rule including the Amphitheatre and golf course. At first, she came in believing the patios outside of the bar areas were developed because of the non-smoking laws as they are public areas and children walk so near. She likes to smoke when she has a cocktail but may not even be able to do this as it is a public area. She is dismayed this commission would want to take away people's rights and this could have a snowball effect.

PROCLAMATION

Dave Waddington read a Proclamation on behalf of "Be Kind to Animals Week", and introduced his dog Oscar who was a rescue dog.

PRESENTATION

Dustin Russell, Northeast Ohio Regional Liaison to Governor John Kasich, said he is presenting a **Proclamation on behalf of Governor Kasich recognizing the 20th anniversary of the City of Sandusky on its Bicentennial**. His visits to Sandusky have been outstanding and he has enjoyed meeting people working for the city and its residents which was on full display when Sandusky hosted the State of the State address and knows people are very proud of what they have in Sandusky. The Bicentennial is an opportunity for residents of the City of Sandusky to celebrate the rich history associated with the community and encouraged residents to use this anniversary to reflect and honor the people, places and events associated with Sandusky's historic past.

Julie Brooks, Board Secretary of the Humane Society of Erie County, said in the April, 1946, edition of the Sandusky Register, **the City Commission presented a Proclamation on behalf of "Be Kind to Animals Week"** and appreciates the city's willingness to do this again. The Humane Society was founded in 1875 and incorporated in 1900. Its purpose was the protection of humans and animals from cruelty, abuse and neglect. Sandusky Register publisher, Mr. I. F. Mack was its President in 1884 and in 1892, the Mayor of Sandusky, Mr. Burkel, expanded the society to include all of Erie County. In the agency annual report for 1951, their mission was "to be motivated by the desire to curb man's inhumanity to man and cruelty to animals. They were concerned with the welfare of children, the aged and the helpless, the blind and the maimed, the hungry, the evicted and ill-treated, and all types of unfortunate residents and transients of the local community. In like manner, it strives to check any and all forms of cruelty to animals and to better their condition." Prior commissioners have shown their concern and passion and they are grateful for this support. Julie Brooks thanked city residents who have faithfully supported the Humane Society for so many years. There are many unsung heroes who give their time as volunteers at the shelter and at fundraisers on behalf of humane treatment to animals. They receive no funding from any sources other than direct contributions and are not associated with or funded by the U.S. Humane Society, nor with any governmental unit in Erie County or beyond. George Mylander was a benefactor and for many years served on the local board. In 1987, he donated the property on Superior Street where the shelter is located. Ruth Parker was also a major benefactor and area foundations and local businesses have all been generous with money and materials. They are currently doubling their space to accept more animals and are updating the shelter to better utilize today's standards of treatment. The ambitious project was designed to be completed in three phases as money from donations become available. Phase I was completed last year allowing two meet & greet adoption areas an area for storage of materials and a commercial washer and dryer for dog bedding, a dog washing station and much more. Phase II will begin in the Spring to renovate the existing space to accommodate more cat houses and add a public education room, offices and updated HVAC system. They hope to secure funding for Phase III later this summer to add more dog kennels, re-roof the entire

building, install heated flooring in the kennels and add indoor/outdoor runs for larger breed dogs. The \$700,000 capital campaign was launched last January and has been very successful; an additional \$170,000 is needed to complete the project.

Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works, said one of the new things in the Capital Plan this year is the Sandusky Neighborhood Initiative including improvements in the Chesapeake Parklet, the Cove area, the Hancock Corridor and the Venice Road connector. Some have large projects while others are smaller. In the downtown area, we have the Jackson Street Pier, Shoreline Drive, City Hall and the Feick Building projects. The numbers look very large but there are tax incremental dollars going into Shoreline Drive and the Jackson Street Pier projects in particular. TIF dollars have boundaries and restrictions and cannot be used for roads similar to uses of water or sewer funds. Various levels of funding are shown for improvements in the parks including for the Pipe Creek Wildlife Preserve, the Landing project and Central Park. The plan contains a lot of information and initiatives. The Sandusky Bay Pathway is listed for \$2.5 million over five years and some are included in the Shoreline Drive project. The campaign promise of \$1.25 million for Issue 8 dollars is a combination of local infrastructure (\$750,000) and a major infrastructure item for things resulting from the Bicentennial vision and other planning processes. In 2016 and 2017, we exceeded this number significantly because of changing revenues throughout the year and this plan is a fluid document. The list included in the documents distributed shows street sealing, resurfacing and reconstruction projects for those completed in 2015 to 2018 although this is not a comprehensive list. In 2020 and 2021, all of U.S. Route 6 will be resurfaced from the east to the west corporation limits by ODOT and roughly \$2.8 million in improvements will be done with the city contributing over \$1 million. Sewer and water numbers are initiatives for the combined sewer overflow system for Venice Road, the lift stations and are the big infrastructure projects which we typically utilize OWDA loans for. We do a rate study every year and things look fine for the foreseeable future. We make sure to take out water and sewer lines as well when we do large projects and all of this information is in the document.

Dennis Murray said this capital project was first done a couple of years ago to plan out how to spend a considerable amount of money. This was pulled together in an orderly way identifying funding sources and putting together a plan going forward. This is an extension of the work he has been doing and another year is added to the plan each year. Wes Poole asked if TIF money can be used for sewer or water expenditures and Aaron Klein clarified sewer and water money cannot be used for streets and TIF's do have specific requirements.

PUBLIC HEARING

The President announced the opening of a Public Hearing regarding the 2018 CDBG program.

Arielle Blanca, Development Manager, said this is the second Public Hearing concerning the city's 2018 CDBG program year. The CDBG is a federally-funded program administered by the Department of Housing & Urban Development and as an entitlement city, Sandusky directly receives an allocation of funds to carry out selected activities within the community. All of the funds must meet one of three national objectives including low to moderate income benefit, elimination of slum and blight and community urgent need. Sandusky anticipates an allocation of approximately \$650,000, an additional \$450,000 in carryover funds plus \$50,000 in program income for a total of \$1,150,000 for PY 2018. The proposed PY 2018 activities have been selected through a public process involving public hearings and meetings. The first public hearing was held February 26 and two Consolidated Plan Advisory Committee meetings were held on February 16 and April 5. The draft plan was made available for a 30-day public comment period which ended at 5 p.m. on April 22. Applications were made available for funding and reviewed for completeness to determine eligibility through a scoring system using a pre-set ranking system.

The proposed activities in the draft plan include:

Program Administration	\$121,000.00
Fair Housing	\$9,000.00
Public Facilities	\$725,000.00
Clearance & Demolition	\$100,000.00
Code Enforcement	\$75,000.00
ECHD 2-1-1	\$5,000.00
Erie County Senior Center	\$15,000.00
VOA Crossroads	\$15,000.00
OHgO Reach	\$15,000.00

This budget includes \$450,000 in anticipated carryover funds; if there is carryover in demolition activity or code enforcement activities, it will remain for PY 2018. Any additional carryover from other activities will be placed in Public Facilities. The amount shown in the draft plan is estimated based on the previous year allocations. Once the City of Sandusky receives this amount from HUD, the plan will be adjusted to match the actual allocation and legislation will be brought to the commission for approval.

Wes Poole asked what the \$725,000 for Public Facilities would be spent on and Arielle Blanca said this would go toward the Jackson Street Pier and Shoreline Drive reconstruction projects. We anticipate \$350,000 to be carryover funds and \$375,000 of new funds. Wes Poole asked if CDBG money is available for water or sewer lines. Arielle Blanca said potentially, so long as it meets all of the requirements. Greg Lockhart asked if CDBG money is available to fix roads and asked the time period for the application to be open. Arielle Blanca said we have used CDBG money in the past to complete road reconstruction projects. The applications became available on February 16 and were due on March 9.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said last year demolitions were figured in at \$148,000 and this year they have gone down to \$100,000; she would like to see this money increased to get the backlog taken care of. The Erie County Land Bank has a grant but it seems to be moving rather slowly and there are more restrictions on this money than the city's. Last year, the city had \$365,000 for neighborhood streets and nothing this year, but we are spending \$725,000 on the Pier and Shoreline Drive; this is too much money for one project all downtown and is not fair. Sharon Johnson said she has been talking with HUD and CDBG funds will not cover paving roads but this is only partly right. Certain maintenance activities are ineligible such as pothole repair or road sealing whereas a new asphalt overlay is considered an eligible improvement. Generally, improvements with a useful life of less than five to eight years are considered repairs and not new construction. These roads do not have the quality when paved and are not lasting long enough for CDBG to cover them and staff should look into this.

Marcie Platte, 1217 Columbus Avenue, said when we originally talked about the Jackson Street Pier, it was going to be covered by a TIF; every time she comes to a meeting, this is being funded by something else and is confused by this. This is like a shell game to see what program it can move under. The more we are making this a park, the less it will be for low- to middle-income people. By removing a lot of fishing from the pier, low-to-moderate income people will be lost and is confused about movement of the TIF money from the pier and onto other things. We are taking money earmarked for low to moderate interests and giving it to the Jackson Street Pier which is already covered by a TIF.

The President declared the Public Hearing closed.

CURRENT BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

CONSENT AGENDA

Dennis Murray asked if anyone wished to remove any of the Consent Agenda items. There were no requests to do so.

A. Submitted by Kelly Kresser, Commission Clerk

The city has received a Notice to Legislative Authority from the Ohio Division of Liquor Control for a new D5J Liquor Permit (*spirituous liquor for on premises consumption only, beer, wine and mixed beverages, for on premises, or off premises in original sealed containers until 2:30 a.m. in a community entertainment district*) for Zeller Gaming Enterprises LLC. It is requested the city commission authorize the Commission Clerk to notify the Ohio Division of Liquor Control the city has no objection to this request.

B. Submitted by Amanda McClain, Housing Manager**PURCHASE & SALE AGREEMENT THROUGH LAND BANK PROGRAM**

Budgetary Information: The cost associated with this purchase and sale agreement is the total amount of the title search, deed preparation and any other customary fees that may be due and payable in the ordinary course of the sale and purchase transaction. The city will recoup the cost of the expenses from the nonrefundable earnest money deposit of \$228 required to be paid by the purchaser. The taxing districts will begin collecting approximately \$212.02 per year in real estate taxes.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-080: It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring that certain real property owned by the city as part of the land reutilization program identified as Parcel #58-01131.000, located north of 713 Decatur Street, Sandusky, is no longer needed for any municipal purpose and authorizing the execution of a purchase and sale agreement with respect to that real property; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

C. Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer**LEASE AGREEMENT AMENDMENT WITH LAKE ERIE ISLAND CRUISES, LLC**

Budgetary Information: For the first year under the lease agreement amendment, the city will be due total annual rent of \$15,500 payable in three installments due on or before June 30, 2018, August 31, 2018, and the balance on or before December 31, 2018. For the final year, there will be no annual rent due to the city. All proceeds will be deposited into the general fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-081: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an amendment to extend the lease agreement with Lake Erie Island Cruises, LLC (referred to as the Goodtime) for primary use of a portion of the dock facilities located on the Jackson Street Pier; and declaring that this ordinance take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

FIRST READING**D. Submitted by John Orzech, Police Chief****DISPOSAL OF FIREARM MAGAZINES**

Budgetary Information: Vance Outdoor will give the Sandusky Police Department a credit of \$715 for the listed items that are no longer needed. These funds will be used to purchase equipment or supplies needed for the Sandusky Police Department.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to dispose of firearm magazines as having become unnecessary and unfit for city use pursuant to Section 25 of the city charter; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda and declare all ordinances and/or resolutions as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in full accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances and/or resolutions, whether it be in full accordance with Section 13 or Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll call on the motion: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. Roll

call on the ordinances and resolutions: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinances and resolutions contained in the Consent Agenda passed in full accordance with the City Charter.

REGULAR AGENDA

SECOND READING

ORDERED IN 3.26.18/FIRST READING 4.9.18

ITEM #1

AMENDMENT TO SMOKING PROHIBITION IN CITY PARKS

ORDINANCE NO. 18-082: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Five (General Offense Code), Chapter 521 (Health, Safety and Sanitation), Section 521.101 (Smoking Prohibited at City Parks) of the codified ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and under second reading.

Upon motion of Wes Poole and second of Greg Lockhart, the commission voted to amend the legislation to include Mills Creek Golf Course and the Paper District Marina.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said about one and one half years ago, we started with contentious talks and settled on prohibiting smoking within 25' of playground equipment. Since that time, there have not been any major disturbances and it seemed to protect the children. Moving forward, Commissioner Lloyd introduced a smoking prohibition in all city parks at the last commission meeting which gave no time to vet what had happened since. It seems we are using a bully policy to force this new legislation on the citizens of Sandusky when it is clear they do not want it. To put this in comparison, we had the transient rentals which was a hot issue and held numerous public meetings for people on the Chaussee at the High School and at City Hall, but have not had one public forum, outside of this room, on the smoking issue. Today, and over the last few meetings, he has counted the opposition from citizens and this outnumbers those who are for the ban. He received 1,500 comments and of these, he counted maybe six for the ban while the rest are against it. As we go forward, there are some interesting things presented; we are spending \$350,000 in parks and recreation with Issue 8 monies. He is not seeing the true representation of the people here. No one is considering what these people are saying, but we can consider them when we talk about transient rental which is of no public health concern to children. He is curious as to how anyone can ignore the people in this room and continue to bully this through just to stand fast on a point someone is trying to make. He had a meeting on Saturday and Wes Poole attended along with fifty or so people and it was unanimous they were against the smoking ban and anybody can see that. We are the government of the people and for the people, so it means we should be listening to them. Another interesting thing he noticed is the City of Huron has put out public opinion polls to listen to their people but Sandusky does not want to listen nor do they want to poll their citizens. Citizens should vote on this legislation and at the very minimum, a public opinion poll should have been put out, but we can only do this for the Chaussee. This is such an important issue the commissioners want to stake their reputation on smoking. There is no reason to continue to bully a lifestyle or prohibition on people when they are clearly against this and does not know how we make up our minds or how we do things for people. These parks are for everyone and the majority of people who have spoken have said they are against this ban and there is not one inkling of compromise, yet there were six or eight months of compromise on transient rental; not one thought for the rest of the citizens and he finds this interesting. Wes Poole said he would like to hear answers to the questions posed by the audience. Dave Waddington said on Saturday, several of the commissioners were at the cleanup and is the reason they did not make the meeting at the UAW Hall. This was scheduled prior to notification of the (UAW) meeting. Wes Poole said some folks asked about the downtown and why the Golf Course and the Paper District Marina pavilion were exempted from this legislation. Wes Poole asked if the nuisance officer would be available for enforcement. John Orzech said the last ban restricting smoking within 25' from play equipment

was complaint driven and envisions this format will be the same. If calls are received, the directive is for officers to give folks a warning letting them know there is a ban in place in the parks and get cooperation for them to extinguish. After this, if there is still an issue, they will deal with them, but the approach will be the same as this makes sense to him. He cannot see assigning particular officers for enforcement because they performing a variety of other duties so whoever is available when a complaint comes in will respond and handle it. Wes Poole asked about the impacts of this on Ohio Bike Week and Mills Creek Golf Course. Eric Wobser said the way our enterprise recreation funds are set up with Mills Creek Golf Course and the Paper District Marina (as opposed to parks), it would take another affirmative action to amend the legislation. Justin Harris said with respect to Ohio Bike Week, if voted on in the affirmative, this law would not become effective until 30 days after today's date which would take us outside of bike week for this year. Moving forward, the only area that would come into play is Schade-Mylander Plaza so bikers and tourists walking around and smoking on the streets, as is customary, would not have an impact. Wes Poole clarified thirty days from today would be during Ohio Bike Week. Wes Poole asked about The Big Splash Raffle which is held at the Pavilion and asked if anyone has given consideration to the impact this has financially on events the city supports. They have been selling tickets for this event and do not have a smoking disclaimer and asked what the plan is for dealing with this and our relationship with these entities is more what he is concerned about. Going forward, it looks as if we are going to spend 27% of Issue 8 on Parks & Recreation which comes from the majority of people who spoke tonight and we are not listening to them. His meeting about this was publicized for anyone to show up on either side of the issue. The people who showed up unanimously said they are against this ban and he received 1,500 comments, all of which were against this ban, yet we are still going ahead with this. There are car shows downtown, Oktoberfest and other festivals and asked what we will do about these events. The owner of the Goodtime said his customers tend to smoke before getting on the boat and asked where they will be able to do this. He cannot see why the commission relents and cannot listen to the people here and it is disappointing. Tim Schwanger and others have said they are looking to repeal Issue 8 because of using their money without listening; he supports this and would sign a petition to repeal it. If there were a public opinion poll taken he could relent. Wes Poole said we started down a path we probably should not have, but pointed out in closed public spaces and sidewalks, this creates a difficult problem for downtown. Every storefront has a sidewalk, except for places where we have given easements to bars and the concept of people leaning on the wall outside should be given more thought before passing this. Greg Lockhart said this legislation states a person cannot smoke outside of a business downtown because it is an enclosed public space where the public is permitted for ingress or egress. This means a person cannot smoke if walking down a sidewalk on Columbus Avenue, Market Street or Water Street or in front of a business entrance and asked how a person would smoke in front of a business if smoking is prohibited on a sidewalk. Justin Harris said Section 5 addresses enclosed areas, but standing outside of a bar is not an enclosed area by the state's definition and is not part of the ordinance. An area with a roof or other overhead covering which was intended to mean shelters in parks and/or plazas; private property or a private residence does not constitute public property. Sidewalks are not enclosed and they do not have an overhang or overhead so someone leaning on a wall outside of an establishment is not included and the officers will not mess with someone. Wes Poole said this includes any ingress/egress access points, sidewalks, driveways or parking lots to the areas. Sidewalks in front of buildings (other than Daly's which has easements and prescribed areas where people can smoke) lead to these places near the doors and access points. Justin Harris said Bertsch Jewelers is not a public area. Justin Harris said state law prohibits smoking inside public businesses; this legislation deals only with parks. Greg Lockhart said ORC Section 3794.01 – Definitions, Item C means "a place of employment, an enclosed area under the direct or indirect control of an employer that employs employees for the use or work or any purpose including but not limited to offices, meeting rooms, sales, production, storage areas, restrooms, stairways, hallways, warehouses, garages and vehicles, and enclosed areas as described herein as a place of employment without regard to time of day or presence of employees." This means any business which employs someone downtown. An enclosed area means an area with a roof or any overhead hanging. It also includes any place which permits the public or the public is invited. State law does not include sidewalks

while this city law does include them. Naomi Twine said smoking is prohibited in state buildings and this is a state law. City sidewalks are public areas and restaurants are owned by a business and if a restaurant chooses they do not want to have smoking it is up to them; perhaps she is wrong, but we are putting way too much into this ordinance. This is preventing smoking in our city parks, the golf course and marina, so we should not make this harder than it is. Justin Harris said the definition, as written, does not include the sidewalks or streets when walking downtown. This would suffice for any reasonable person, a prosecutor or a police officer to not cite someone for standing outside of a business smoking a cigarette. Nikki Lloyd said this ordinance is just for the parks, plazas, piers and bike paths and the sidewalks connected to them; it is not for sidewalks in the downtown area or in front of homes. State law places responsibility on a business owner to protect their employees and with this smoking suggestion, it is the owners' responsibility to protect employees and patrons from exits and entrances of their property. The problem is the State of Ohio has not regulated or deemed what is appropriate for the distance and the business owner can interpret them however they wish. Naomi Twine said it is 25' from an entrance. This is for government or municipal buildings, not privately-owned properties, and this is where the confusion lies. Dennis Murray said we are not debating state law, it is what it is.

Discussion: Wes Poole said there is to be no smoking for basketball or for white folks playing golf. He finds it totally unacceptable to decide to simply exempt folks who play golf from this and it is obvious folks realize this is onerous and is not helping any kids. If smoking is allowed in the marina area where kids watch movies every year, it is very clear this has nothing to do with kids. This is driving folks away from downtown and punishing folks who smoke and there is no more to it. Wes Poole asked if anyone really thinks people who have kids go two blocks away from their house to smoke because of the idea smoking 300' away is endangering a child. This decision is being made based on what has been presented and more people came here today to vote against this and the basis for this just does not exist. The idea he has to make a decision whether to leave the park with his children because of smokers when our parks are darn near empty unless there is an event is absurd. We are deciding for elderly people who live downtown and cannot go to a park and may be in wheelchairs. We have a community we are taxing and should be embracing the concept of creating community where smokers respect non-smokers, but the idea is "we have five votes". Allowing people to smoke at the golf course but not allowing basketball players to smoke is Jim Crow. We have identified a specific group to be exempted and allowed to enjoy their cigarettes while disadvantaging another. Changes made in staffing here are following a pattern and we will cover this later. Greg Lockhart said speaking on the amendment, Commissioner Poole was correct the Paper District Marina has the Touch-A-Truck event with thousands of kids mixing in with the boaters who may or may not be smoking. Additionally, we have Dockside Café where 200 to 300 people go each day to drink and smoke. We host movies on the hill every week where there are tons of kids. At the golf course, there are kids who golf and there are tournaments for them. Apparently, prima facie, it does seem a little bit aristocratic to be taking out smoking in areas which seem to be affluent. If people fishing cannot smoke, why it is golfers or people at the marina with expensive boats are exempted. If this is truly a public concern, the marina and golf course are taken care of by our parks and recreation staff and this is public property. One can play semantics, but children are in these areas more than anywhere. We had record numbers of children come down for the Touch-A-Truck event and to say it is exempt seems a little biased and is bad business. It is time we start listening to the people; bulling people and then doing another thing does not look good. If you live by the sword, you die by the sword. Wes Poole said for clarity, a public place, by definition, means an enclosed area to which the public is invited or in which the public is permitted and is not a private residence. All this tap dancing around trying to exclude the downtown businesses is incorrect because state law defines public places and unless we define it differently, he presumes it applies. Likewise, he does not recognize sidewalks are excluded but if they are included, walking down the sidewalk smoking next to ingress or egress of any downtown building is covered by this legislation.

Roll call on the motion to amend: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion to amend passed.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules, as amended, and at second reading.

FIRST READING

ITEM #2 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

APPROVAL OF 2018 FIVE-YEAR CAPITAL IMPROVEMENT PLAN

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact at this time. Costs will be allocated to the appropriate funds as individual projects are presented for a vote at City Commission meetings. It is important to note that approval of the Plan is not an approval of each project; the costs included are budgetary numbers that will change as projects are designed and publicly bid.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed approving and adopting the 2018 five-year capital improvement plan for the City of Sandusky.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Wes Poole said what we have here is a disagreement as to how the money is spent and not enough of Issue 8 monies are being spent in the neighborhoods. Additionally, there is nothing in this plan to suggest we will take care of the people who actually live here between pickle ball, kayaking, canoe liveries and all of the things we are putting in while still playing on substandard basketball courts. For these reasons and many others, he is going to vote no as he is not satisfied this money is being spent fairly across the board for people living and paying taxes in the city. Greg Lockhart said he concurs with Wes Poole money is not being spent correctly or with the consent or the will of the people of this city and will vote no as well. Dennis Murray said this plan calls for \$6.5 million to be spent in neighborhoods outside the areas spoken of tonight for sidewalks, trees and other improvements and over \$19 million on recreation and in our city parks. Although he does not know specifically when we will address issues with the basketball courts, he knows they are important and are part of the plan. We have had this document for over a week now and if there were questions about where particular expenditures would be made, they could have been asked before tonight. Dick Brady said we mobilized city work crews to install \$100,000 worth of play equipment for Central Park and this will be the next effort and considers this expenditure to be significant.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #3 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

ENTERPRISE ZONE TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENT WITH GUNDLACH SHEET METAL

Budgetary Information: The project will have an ongoing positive impact on the general fund as 25% of the increase in value will be subject to real estate taxes during the abatement period. The project will also help sustain construction jobs in the local economy and will create an estimated and minimum of four and one half full-time equivalent employment positions that will be subject to city income tax.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-083: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an enterprise zone agreement with Gundlach Sheet Metal Works,

Inc.; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Matt Lasko said these items (#3 and #4) are for an enterprise zone tax abatement for ten years at 75% as well as an economic development grant for Gundlach's \$50,000 expansion project. The Gundlach name is very well known and they have been serving the Sandusky area for about 125 years. They have mainly focused on HVAC and installation/engineering and have been a great civic partner for the city. The business is located in a very dense urban environment and when a business is successful, it needs to expand and they have done this by being timely in acquiring adjacent properties as they have become available and this project exemplifies this. Multiple buildings have been cobbled together through the years and their parking, storage and delivery areas in the back allow for a very tight site plan which will finally be made more efficient and add very necessary expansion space. Gundlach employs five persons and this does fluctuate seasonally, but they are in need of large equipment warehousing, additional and more efficient office spaces, additional parking and an increased fabrication area. They have been acquiring adjacent properties, most recently on Division Street, where two blighted properties were demolished to allow for the expansion, storage and warehousing structure to the east of the facility on Columbus Avenue. One of the inefficiencies of cobbling buildings together are the layouts within the space as it relates to office and conference areas. In addition to the inclusion of a new 6,250 SF warehouse, there will be about \$300,000 of interior remodeling which will completely change the floor plans of the interior space. In the enterprise zone agreement, the exact improvement number has not been determined and there may be changes with construction projects. With the enterprise zone tax abatement agreement, they would be expected to invest anywhere between \$850,000 to over \$1 million; we have estimated \$900,000 in improvements with \$300,000 going into an interior office remodel and \$600,000 into property acquisition and warehouse construction. The owners have agreed to put \$400,000 into the project with a \$450,000 line of credit. The grant request, approved by the Economic Development Incentive Committee, was \$50,000 for substantial redevelopment which is 5.5% of the project costs being requested of the city. This agreement was heard by the Sandusky City School Board on April 9 and approved unanimously. As a result of this project, Gundlach will also be committing to four and one half new jobs through a combination of warehousing and office staff. They have also agreed to an increased payroll of \$475,000. This project will be completed by March 31, 2019. Dick Brady said he hopes people realize how tough it is for a company like this to make a decision to do what they are doing and how easy it would be for them to go across Perkins Avenue into wide open space and on relatively inexpensive land. They are tin-knockers because they make a lot of noise so for them to be nestled inside the heart of the city means they have spent 125 years being good neighbors or this room would be filled with people complaining about them. He is glad we can extend these kind of dollars and also extended a thanks for taking a chance and staying here. Greg Lockhart said he is glad Gundlach Sheet Metal is still in our city and we are able to retain them. Small business is and always will be the backbone of America and the city will continue to do what it can for them.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #4 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer**GRANT AGREEMENT WITH GUNDLACH SHEET METAL**

Budgetary Information: The city will be responsible for providing a total of \$50,000 in grant proceeds from the economic development capital projects fund on a reimbursable basis at the completion of the project.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-084: It is requested an ordinance be passed approving a grant in the amount of \$50,000 through the substantial development grant program to Gundlach Sheet Metal Works, Inc., in relation to the property located at 910 Columbus Avenue; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dick Brady, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said this is a good investment for the city; \$450,000 in additional payroll will allow recoupment of our investment inside of five years.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #5 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer**ESTABLISHMENT OF CENTRAL PUBLIC IMPROVEMENT TAX INCREMENT EQUIVALENT FUND**

Budgetary Information: One hundred percent of the real estate taxes collected from the increase in assessed value of exempted parcels will be deposited into the fund. These real estate taxes will be deposited into the fund for a period of thirty years for each individual parcel beginning on the sooner of the tax year in which the value of any improvement on a parcel exceeds \$50,000 or tax year 2021. On an annual basis, the city will cause ten percent of collected real estate taxes to be disbursed to the Sandusky City School District per the school compensation agreement.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-085: It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring improvements to certain parcels of real property to be a public purpose, describing the public improvements to be made to directly benefit such parcels, requiring the owner of the improvements on such parcel to make service payments in lieu of taxes, establishing a municipal public improvement tax increment equivalent fund (Central Public Improvement Fund) for the deposit of such service payments, approving the compensation agreement with Sandusky City School District, and related authorizations pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Sections 5709.40, 5709.42 and 5709.43; and declaring an emergency.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Matt Lasko said these three pieces of legislation (Items #5, #6 and #7) are intermingled at some level. They will have no effect on real estate taxes currently being paid by each parcel which has been attached in the maps. These will continue to be paid and broken up accordingly to the receiving bodies. Although it is called a tax abatement on paper, it really is not. The projects which we hope are constructed on these parcels will continue to make a level of payment as they would if this were a true redevelopment project for real estate taxes. Whenever these properties are assessed and revalued, monies will be collected as service payments or payments in lieu of taxes instead of being collected as real estate taxes. Although an abatement on paper, these properties will pay the same as if they were not included as TIF funds. The Ohio Revised Code allows municipalities to describe public improvements they want to see made on parcels and get to declare these improvements as having a public purpose. We

also get to provide for service payments to be made in lieu of real estate tax payments and have the ability to establish funds for those service payments to be paid to undertake certain approved public infrastructure. These can be things such as infrastructure to improve traffic flow, safety and road service improvements, lighting, signage, signalization improvements, public facilities, recreational trails and other things with a public benefit. There are two similar pieces of legislation which will result in the creation of two distinct funds: Cleveland Area Road Fund and the Central Improvement Fund. A map has been provided for the parcels to be included which will be subject to the service payments for each respective piece of legislation. It is a combination of private buildings and privately-owned parcels, underutilized real estate and publicly-owned real estate which we anticipate improvements will be carried out on. There is an umbrella compensation agreement which was unanimously approved by the Sandusky City School Board. One hundred percent of the real estate taxes collected will be deposited into the fund on the new valuation for a period of thirty years. This is not unlike the length of time already on the books with both the Chesapeake TIF and the Battery Park TIF agreements which recently expired. One of the big distinctions is those TIF agreements were district agreements and funds collected from those projects had to be invested in a very finite geographic area. These do not necessarily operate the same as they are not district TIF agreements in which every parcel has to pay into with a very certain boundary. We have to identify the exact parcels to pay into these funds and public infrastructure and public improvements can occur anywhere which would benefit the general public and the parcels paying into the fund. These parcels would begin paying for a period of thirty years on the sooner of 2021, or when each parcel experiences \$50,000 in increased valuation. There may be several parcels which start paying in 2019, there may be others which start paying in 2020, but no parcel can pay after 2021 to start the clock. The other important thing is both of these funds are under an umbrella compensation agreement. Through this agreement, ten percent of the funds will be paid back to the schools on an annual basis for their use so the net effect is ninety percent of the collections for a period of thirty years will be what the city has to invest in public infrastructure and public improvement projects to benefit these parcels. Justin Harris said the ORC uses the phrase tax abatement because real estate taxes are being paid; if \$50,000 is being paid in property taxes for a property valued at \$500,000, they will continue to pay \$50,000. If a parcel's value increases to \$1 million, they would be required to pay an additional \$50,000. They would still pay this and it is not designated as property tax and is why it is called an abatement. We are not taking away money from taxpayers; these folks will make improvements on the property and the taxpayers are getting more value with the school board's approval because we will get 90% of the taxes. Eric Wobser said on the east side of town with the Sports Force project and in the vicinity of Battery Park and downtown, there are significant projects planned or underway which will invest over \$100 million into the city. For these projects to be able to move forward, there is a massive amount of infrastructure to be put into place to support them, particularly at the sports center site because it was developed as an airport, not as a sports complex. This is a particularly good example of why the state has created the ability for TIF agreements to be enacted and because of the cost of infrastructure the ability to use tax dollars over a period of time on an upfront basis. We have been working with the school board for over one year to identify and put this TIF agreement into place. The previous TIF agreements passed by the city did not include a special payment but in this case, the schools will receive that ten percent benefit which is important. This allows us to invest in the infrastructure, allow these projects to go forward, and to be successful as well as to invest in the infrastructure to connect them. The Sandusky Bay Pathway project is slated to receive a big portion of this to make these public improvements and nearly all of the city will benefit from these investments because the pathway will be expanded from the west to the east side of Sandusky. The School Board was very excited about the pathway project receiving a portion of this funding because they know it will make Sandusky a more exciting place to live and will bring more families and tax base into the district. Wes Poole said specific pieces of property were chosen for this and there must be a specific plan for the infrastructure to be improved. Matt Lasko said the parcels selected were based on projects currently under construction or imminent as well as sites where we view development likely to occur. We need to ensure the public new infrastructure benefits those parcels first and foremost, and the general public secondarily. One of the obvious ideas is the Sandusky Bay

Pathway will go through downtown, and secondarily, there is a whole host of potential road projects these funds could be eligible for including East Water Street, Market Street, Columbus Avenue and Warren Street. These projects do not necessarily have to be identified today; what is important is including the parcels now which we think will likely be contributors to be able to do public infrastructure later. Once these projects are placed into service, they are unable to be included within the TIF boundary. There will be a lot of planning and ultimately the commission is going to have the final say on the projects to move forward. It was most important to identify these parcels and include them so we do not miss our window to include them. Eric Wobser said it is critical to note first and foremost the infrastructure required to complete the project itself is a top priority and we would look to provide the actual connections to the water and sewer and then look to ancillary improvements which would continue to benefit the project around the area. Greg Lockhart asked what the boundaries would be and Matt Lasko said unlike the Chesapeake or Battery Park TIF agreements, there are not formal boundaries with these two pieces of legislation where we have very finite areas to spend the funds. We are identifying the parcels to pay into the funds but are not creating rigid boundaries for expenditures. The legal rule of thumb is what we spend the funds on needs to be defensible and there must be a benefit to the parcels paying into the fund. This could be by an adjacent or a direct connection, but there needs to be a tie-in between the parcels paying into the fund and the use or benefit to them. Nikki Lloyd thanked city staff and the Sandusky City Schools; this is very detailed and very complicated, but is a great example of what we can do together to keep moving forward. Wes Poole said several of these parcels are currently parking lots and asked what we expect to increase in tax value; some are city-owned. Eric Wobser said we identified both projects slated for development as under-utilized or unimproved areas such as parking lots. The Master Plan adopted by the city in 2016 identifies specific parcels owned by the city for some higher and better use. This does not necessarily mean they will be improved, but should public improvements take place on them over time, we would have the ability to pay for them with TIF infrastructure. One of the eligible uses of this TIF would be to create structured parking in a denser area which seems to be the trend. Wes Poole said the parking lot at Market and Hancock Streets, the one behind Amarone, the one owned by Civista Bank and the one behind the former Cardinal Grocery Store have all been identified and does not think we have enough parking downtown now. If the commission is asked to use TIF money on undefined uses for lots which already exist and could become something other than parking without a complete plan explaining how they will be taken out of the mix as parking and make downtown work, he cannot support this today. This leaves too much to chance and we have already taken 170 spaces off of the Jackson Street Pier. We have added what amounts to 100 additional cars just by using the new building where 66 apartments are going and we have other areas where people are being brought downtown to live. We have identified the two outskirt parking lots as possible for another kind of development. Wes Poole said he is not opposed to advancement, but cannot vote for something which does not have a chance to work. Eric Wobser said any building on city-owned land, any sale of city-owned land or any expenditure of these funds over \$10,000 will have to come back to the commission for approval. All of the sites mentioned are within the framework of what is being proposed in the Bicentennial Vision Plan and we are not looking to do anything outside of this. We also know from parking counts last year, these lots are empty almost all of the time and we could not develop them without a commission vote as we cannot expend these funds until an account is created for expenditures over \$10,000. Dennis Murray said he is voting on this because any monies to be expended have to come back to the commission for a vote although he does not necessarily favor selling every single parcel listed which is owned by the city. This has yet to be determined based upon what is proposed, but nothing has yet been proposed. His concern is if we do not do this now, we cannot do it later and the availability to raise these funds through TIF financing would be gone. We are at a point where we can put these properties into a TIF district and access these dollars for public improvements, but if we wait until all of this is done, we will not be able to access them and we will not have the dollars available to support the public improvements. This is one of those magical moments where if we do it now, we can attract the additional investment to continue this momentum well into the future. There are a lot of things these dollars could be spent on to provide an amazing amenity for everyone in the community from one end to the other and is

something few communities could ever hope to do. We have so much publicly available land and waterfront accessibility and the true gem is The Landing Park which may ultimately be the single largest beneficiary of this depending on how things go. Dennis Murray asked how many communities have the ability to create a brand new waterfront park in a community built out for many years. We have to spend the dollars to improve them and is what he finds most exciting about this. Greg Lockhart said he is all for progress, moving the city forward and having these things done, but there seems to be a good deal of uncertainty in this legislation. Based upon legislation passed today, he cannot vote on whim and uncertainty and will be against this legislation and most things like this in the foreseeable future for the next two years. Wes Poole asked where these opportunities are going to go and wonders why we cannot do something later if we do not do something now. He does not understand why it is impossible for us to have progress without someone presenting a proposal and then do this parcel by parcel. Sadly, many of us will not be comfortable with the due diligence and judgment the commission has as a result of how we came to a conclusion on the smoking ban created tonight. Dennis Murray said if we wait to have every single question answered about how public improvements and private investment might come about over the course of the next five to fifteen years, we will not be able to make a decision today to provide a foundation for the public improvements. Dennis Murray said he respects the fact there are always going to be additional questions needing to be answered, but these are not all answerable. We know Cedar Point wants to put in the sports center, but beyond this we really do not know who is coming to us to do various things. Greg Lockhart said we do not know and this is part of the decision we have to make to plan for the future; however, based upon the smoking legislation and direction, we are not focusing on the roads, our fire and police department and other things. We should put a little more focus there just as much as we are for development. He is all for development but based on this being undefined for the next two years, cannot see voting on things of great public interest without properly vetting them.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #6 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

ESTABLISHMENT OF CLEVELAND ROAD PUBLIC IMPROVEMENT TAX INCREMENT EQUIVALENT FUND

Budgetary Information: One hundred percent of the real estate taxes collected from the increase in assessed value of exempted parcels will be deposited into the fund. These real estate taxes will be deposited into the fund for a period of thirty years for each individual parcel beginning on the sooner of the tax year in which the value of any improvement on a parcel exceeds \$50,000 or tax year 2021. On an annual basis, the city will cause ten percent of collected real estate taxes to be disbursed to the Sandusky City School district per the school compensation agreement.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-086: It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring improvements to certain parcels of real property to be a public purpose, describing the public improvements to be made to directly benefit such parcels, requiring the owner of the improvements on such parcel to make service payments in lieu of taxes, establishing a municipal public improvement tax increment equivalent fund (Cleveland Road public improvement fund) for the deposit of such service payments, approving the compensation agreement with Sandusky City School District, and related authorizations pursuant to Ohio Revised Code sections 5709.40, 5709.42 and 5709.43; and declaring an emergency.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Wes Poole asked what area this covers. Matt Lasko said the parcels have been identified which will be paying into the fund and there are no boundaries. We have identified parcels which would eventually pay into the fund should development occur; these improvements would have to be for the benefit of those properties. This is non-traditional from what has come before the commission in the past with the Chesapeake and Battery Park TIF agreements and a map was included with tonight's agenda.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #7 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

APPROVAL OF COMPENSATION AGREEMENT WITH SANDUSKY CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT

Budgetary Information: One hundred percent of the real estate taxes collected from the increase in assessed value of exempted parcels will be deposited into the central public improvement fund. These real estate taxes will be deposited into the funds for a period of thirty years for each individual parcel beginning on the sooner of the tax year in which the value of any improvement on a parcel exceeds \$50,000 or tax year 2021. On an annual basis, the city will cause ten percent of collected real estate taxes to be disbursed to the Sandusky School District per the school compensation agreement.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-087: It is requested an ordinance be passed approving a compensation agreement with Sandusky City School District relating to public improvement funds established for the downtown area and Cleveland Road area; authorizing and directing the City Manager to execute the compensation agreement; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady and Nikki Lloyd, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #8 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

AMENDMENT TO DOWNTOWN COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT AREA & ESTABLISHMENT OF NEW RESIDENTIAL COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT AREA

Budgetary Information: There are no budgetary effects as a result of this legislation and ordinance.

ORDINANCE NO. 18-088: It is requested an ordinance be passed implementing Sections 3735.65 through 3735.70 of the Ohio Revised Code to implement an expanded Community Reinvestment Area in the City of Sandusky, Ohio, and related matters, and declaring an emergency.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dick Brady, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart asked if this is the original amendment we used to expand the Chesapeake TIF to be inclusive of all downtown. Matt Lasko said it is exciting to bring this piece of legislation which was announced publicly for the first time at the last State of the City address and included in our Master Plan. This would be a city-wide residential tax abatement to incentivize and promote the rehabilitation of new construction of residential property in the

city. Similar to the TIF agreements, this is another ability of municipalities under the Ohio Revised Code to designate community reinvestment areas to incentivize new residential, commercial and industrial development by making real estate tax exemptions available. The city currently has a CRA district in place. It is very limited to a small section of downtown and has been in place since 2003. As we went through the recession, plus with the limited geography, it was a lightly-used residential CRA while we used several commercial tax abatements through downtown. This has been very limited from a residential standpoint in its use and only about 20 properties have gone through this since it was introduced. We did a housing study in 2015 which took a lot of time and effort and included a parcel-by-parcel analysis with lots of statistics and data. One of the most important takeaways is we have an aged but historic housing stock with a number of properties needing to be demolished. We had a lot of opportunity to reinvest in them, stabilize our housing stock and spur new construction. The recommendation was to create incentives for this activity to occur. One of the ways we did this was through setting aside a portion of Issue 8 funds for blight elimination, housing development and beautification programs which have been wisely successful in their use in the city. Secondly, another available incentive is to provide residential tax abatement city-wide. We are proposing an amendment and an expansion of our existing residential CRA. Not dissimilar to what is in place, we would anticipate people filling out the application and then being granted the abatement; it would not come back to the commission or to the school board for individual review and approval. The ORC does set the minimum thresholds to be eligible for abatement. We would have loved a little bit higher threshold but the ORC sets the minimums. To be eligible for abatement, a one- or two-family property would need to invest \$2,500 or more. A three-unit property would need to minimally invest \$5,000. There are no restrictions in the types of improvements one would need to make. The benefit would be for ten years at 75% of the improved value so real estate taxes currently being paid would remain unchanged and 25% of the new assessed value would be collected from the property owner. We wanted to ensure this was not completely open-ended and not subject to review at some point by future city commissioners. The legislation allows for the commission to have a program review on December 31, 2018, to see if it should be amended, repealed or expanded, and then is subject to review every five years thereafter as market conditions change, etc. We hope this is a program which incentivizes and spurs the momentum we are already seeing, but at some point it may be appropriate to repeal as the market continues to grow to a point where it may become unnecessary and this is certainly the hope. As with the rest of the legislation from a TIF standpoint, this was considered by the Sandusky City Schools and unanimously approved. They will continue to maintain their base line tax collection, they will be able to tap into some of the 25% increase, and they see this is a program to help people stay in their homes and make improvements which will ultimately improve the tax value, will allow for new construction to be spurred and will bring more families and children into the city. There is no budgetary effect for us to operate the program other than to administer it and put the county and the school board on notice when we grant an abatement. Greg Lockhart asked what portion of downtown this covers and Matt Lasko said it is from Jackson to Hancock Streets and Washington Street to the north. This is not to be confused with the expansion of the urban renewal area which utilizes the Chesapeake TIF boundary. We did an expansion of this eastward but this was similar to the residential CRA. This is only a program for three units or less; four unit properties or apartment complexes looking to make improvements would have to come before the school board and the commission on an individual basis. Moving forward, the CRA will strictly be residential. We have an enterprise zone ability to grant tax abatements. Dennis Murray said in terms of providing support for our neighborhoods, he does not know if there is anything more important. The Sandusky Neighborhood Initiative program is very important, but this leverages millions of dollars of private investment by homeowners which ultimately relate to dollars to improve their properties and is a tremendous opportunity. It is also important to keep in mind to some extent this is a competitive measure because what we are seeing in many older communities in Ohio with similar housing stock is they have similar programs, some of them considerably more generous. It is important for us to recognize this as well. Wes Poole said this is available city-wide for residential, single-family for up to three units, and, as an example, if someone absorbs a lot next door in the mow-to-own, they can place a garage on it and would qualify. We are

giving people in the community an opportunity to fix up their homes without raising their property taxes. Matt Lasko said this is an incentive to make improvements to properties or build new housing in the city. Residents, conceivably, could see an increase in property values and would be liable to continue to pay 25% extra for the increase. One of the things which will ultimately be decided by the county's appraisal department is some improvements may have no effect on valuation while others will. Kitchen improvements, expansions, additions and garages are likely to have a very clear and identifiable value adjustment in the positive. There may be other improvements which are very modest and not valued by the county as increasing value and in these instances, it would not make much sense for the homeowner to go through the administrative task of filing application for something they will not see a benefit from. We have other ways to incentivize them for these improvements if not through a tax abatement, through our housing development and beautification program. We see a lot of momentum and it is great to stack the deck and take advantage of this window while being cognizant of the fact if all goes according to plan and the market continues this momentum, we should build in some opportunities to reevaluate whether the program should be altered, expanded or cease to exist based on market conditions ten years down the road. Wes Poole said this is great and thinks it would be helpful for people at home making decisions and unsure whether to commit to this if we had some concept of specific dollar amounts to give them a better picture. He does not want anyone to miss out on this because they have not done the math or because it is too complicated to get into. Matt Lasko said as we did with the housing programs, we can staff and moderate a meeting or two to get the word out in addition to other forms of publication because this is important. With this legislation, assuming it is supported by the commission tonight, the program is not automatically up and running. We are authorizing the city to make petition and application to the Ohio Development Services Agency to get their formal blessing. We hope to be up and running early to mid-summer, but need to wait for notification from the state they have accepted our application.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

FIRST READING

ITEM #9 – Submitted by Eric Wobser, City Manager

ADDITION OF PROTECTED CLASSES FOR HOUSING MATTERS AND PROHIBITING DISCRIMINATION IN EMPLOYMENT AND PUBLIC ACCOMMODATIONS

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Five (General Offenses Code), Chapter 539 (Open Housing Code), Section 541.08 (Ethnic Intimidation), and by the addition of Chapter 557 (Discrimination Offenses other than Housing) of the Codified Ordinances, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Justin Harris said when he started in 2016, this legislation was being worked on to bring three chapters of our codified ordinances dealing with discrimination into conformity with other communities to add sexual orientation and gender identify to our housing code as well as employment discrimination and other areas outside of housing. This adds sexual orientation and gender identity as an additional protected class for housing discrimination. If violations occur, these will still be handled by the Fair Housing Board. This also criminalizes discrimination and areas outside of housing as a protected class and for other public accommodations. We ran this by some of our major employers in the city as well as the schools and they are onboard and support this amendment and believe the city commission should support it. Dennis Murray said Naomi Twine also walked this past the Chamber of Commerce who supports the legislation.

Greg Lockhart thanked Justin Harris for bringing this legislation forward and said it is always timely and equates this with anyone's rights, regardless of gender. Today we are lucky to have four minorities serving on the commission but it would be nice to have more minorities in leadership positions. We are trying to move forward and need to keep this as a focus. We continue to hire women and people of color in positions of authority as directors and supervisors and we are glad to be taking this step forward to be inclusive of all people. Dennis Murray said he is proud we are taking up this legislation and said he voted on similar legislation while in Columbus twice but it was blocked by the other party. This is the right thing to do and is consistent with everything the Catholic Church is doing even as a most conservative organization. Discrimination is not right in housing, education or employment and we are saying this is a standard by which we choose to live and be accountable to and hopefully they eventually hear this in Columbus and Washington to expand protections to all people.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$1,000 from Russell Classic Cancer Fund for the K9 Fund. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$650 for CY 2018 from Dave Waddington.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said \$450 of the donation will go towards Recreation and \$200 will go towards Horticulture.

The President declared the motion passed.

- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$1,703 from Glenda Boykin and Yvette Pearson for a bench in memory of their family member, Jesse Pearson, Jr., to be installed at the end of Shoreline Park with a view of Sandusky Bay and Cedar Point. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **A location has been chosen for the Martin Luther King, Jr. Memorial bust in Washington Park adjacent to the Freedom Shrine. The city will work with the Pioneer Committee and Balconi Monuments for installation, which will occur this summer.**
- **Eric Wobser announced his appointment to the Public Art & Culture Commission including: Beth Maiden, Bryan Stanley, Ethan Unzicker and Rhonda Watt; Martha Wikel will serve as an alternate.**
- **Upon motion of Wes Poole and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted for a Police Officer to be permitted to attend a conference with Health Department personnel for local programming for youth educational opportunities.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said the **Erie County Health Department has launched a new initiative through the Partners in Prevention** program. Devin Pollick is the coordinator of the program and has asked for participation at a national conference. The conference will take place in Orlando July 14 – 19. The ECHD is asking for agencies to cover personnel time and food expenses and asked permission for an officer to attend the training. They will then be involved in local programming for youth educational opportunities.

The President declared the motion passed.

- Naomi Twine and John Orzech have discussed and will make a **recommendation to the Civil Service Commission** to allow a five percent credit for candidates with an Associate's Degree and ten percent credit for candidates with a Bachelor's Degree in a law enforcement or related field of study. This recommendation will be presented, along with other potential recommended changes, by police and fire.
- The **Fire Department is developing a drone program** to assist in search and rescue and planning. The program is being led by Fire Fighter Bill Reyes and Fire Fighter Jeff Danevich. They both attended class at Kent State University for the "Train the Trainer" program which is expected to be up and running by the end of the 2018.
- The Fire Department is re-establishing and expanding the **Technical Rescue Team**. Departmental members will be certified in rope rescue, high angle rescue, trench rescue and dive certification. The Sandusky Fire Department is striving for excellence as it relates to the modern advances in the technical rescue field.
- The Fire Department has placed a new **Chevy Tahoe Command Vehicle into service which will provide much-needed communications and technological support in order to run a safe and efficient emergency scene**. The Fire Department would like to acknowledge Troy Vaccaro from the Fleet Maintenance Department and his team for the many man hours spent getting this vehicle ready for service.
- Fire Fighter **Jeff Danevich has been recently appointed as the Department's Community Impact Officer**. His task will be to address all public requests for the presence of the Fire Department and to establish programs which will help the Department's members serve and intervene on behalf of the citizens by means of community responsiveness.
- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dick Brady, the commission voted to move forward with purchasing HVAC units for Big Island Water Works (BIWW).**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said the HVAC units which cool the main electrical room at BIWW have failed and the current system is a specialty unit and will take two weeks to install once ordered. A formal communication regarding this work will be submitted for the May 14 meeting but is asking for tentative approval to ensure continuous operation and installation before warmer temperatures arrive.

The President declared the motion passed.

- The next scheduled **Audit/Finance Committee meeting** is June 22 at 7:45 a.m.
- There are two **spring clean-up opportunities** available to city residents free of charge. Drive-thru drop-off day will take place on April 28 at the Shelby Street boat launch overflow parking lot, 101 Shelby Street. In addition, residents are welcome to drop off yard waste at Barnes Nursery, 1630 Camp Road in Huron, on May 5 and May 6. For further details, please call 419.627.5829.
- Congratulations to **Luke Kromer on his recent promotion from Foreman to Chief Foreman in the Division of Sewer Maintenance**.
- We would like to welcome **Connor Lenthe, who has joined the Waste Water Treatment Plant as an Assistant Plant Operator and Melissa Vassallo who has joined the Division of Facilities & Properties as an administrative assistant**. Staff has also begun hiring many seasonal employees.

- Staff is considering submitting two **applications to the US Forest Service through the Great Lakes** which would be due May 11. If applications are submitted, staff will seek formal approval at a meeting in May.
- The city received eight qualification packets for **Shoreline Drive and seven for the Jackson Street Pier**. Staff has moved onto the Request for Proposals stage. Preliminary plans and specifications were provided to four design/build teams for each project, with proposals due in June. These documents can be viewed in the Engineering Division if anyone is interested since file sizes are so large they cannot be emailed.
- Unfortunately, **the city was not awarded the grant application for pedestrian signal improvements at the Pierce Street and Hayes Avenue intersection.**
- We are pleased to announce the hiring of **Debi Eversole for the position of Housing Development Specialist**. Debi has been the Administrative Assistant for the Department of Planning and Department of Community Development since January of 2016. Until her former position is filled, she will continue to handle administrative duties for both departments. In this role, she will be responsible for administering the Housing Development and Beautification programs, residential tax abatement program and other special projects related to housing.
- The city has once again received overwhelming interest and participation in our citywide **housing improvement and beautification program** in 2018. As of April 19, only approximately \$145,000 in uncommitted funding remains from the original \$360,000 in program funds, and the city is currently reviewing an additional 40 applications. City-wide funding is expected to be fully committed in the next two to three weeks. Properties located in our model blocks are still eligible for funding after city-wide funding is exhausted.
- The regular **Planning Commission** meeting is scheduled for April 25 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room. There will be a public hearing held at this meeting in regard to the proposed **transient overlay district for the Cove District**.
- A **Landmark Commission** meeting has been scheduled for April 25 immediately following the Planning Commission.
- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to provide \$500 to the United Way of Erie County which were proceeds from the inaugural Dot the I, Block the M walk/run.**

Discussion: The Recreation Department will be providing **\$500 to the United Way of Erie County as the proceeds from our 2017 Dot the I, Block the M walk/run**. The United Way of Erie County, with the help of Buckeye Broadband, was a great partner for the event at Cameo Pizza. United Way of Erie County and its partners provided volunteers, raffle prizes and race officials for the inaugural event. The partnership will continue in 2018 with this year's race on November 24 starting and ending at Cameo Pizza at Central Park.

The President declared the motion passed.

- Per the Sandusky City Commission's approval, **the Recreation Department will be applying for grant funding through Erie Metro Parks' Local Park Capital Improvement grant program**. The funds, if awarded, will be used for two future projects: 1) to purchase paint and paint supplies for a collaborative project with the Sandusky City Schools art students at Wightman-Wieber Park's ice rink; and, 2) to provide resurfacing of a former tennis court at Venice Park to convert the court to four Pickle Ball courts through a collaboration with donated materials/labor from SportMaster Sports Surfaces.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to appoint Amy Francis to the ADA/Fair Housing Board for a term ending December 31, 2019.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said he would like to see and it is our best interest to have people from the disabled community on this board so they have good representation. The Clerk may have stated there is potential one of the applicants is disabled in the list provided. Kelly Kresser said one of the applicants has been involved with the MS Walk and believes she or her husband had multiple sclerosis. Naomi Twine said she has known Amy Francis since Junior High school and she has taken care of her mother and husband who are both disabled and have since passed and recommended her appointment. Greg Lockhart said he does not see a problem with any particular candidate, but he has learned so much from the disabled in the community since being on the ADA Committee. They know and see things we cannot see such as sidewalks downtown. We lost Lovey Leavell and Carol Steele which was sad and one was partially disabled.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to appoint Tim Berkey and Joe Galea to the Landmark Commission for terms expiring December 31, 2018, as well as appointing Alan Griffiths for a term expiring December 31, 2019 and Jon Lawrence and Mike Zuilhof for terms expiring December 31, 2020.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said for some time, members of the Planning Commission have served on the Landmark Commission always with the thought they would be separated when there were others who wished to serve.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dick Brady, the commission voted to appoint Marsha Carrington, Robin Hudnall, Adam Ramsdell, Cable Steinemann and Jordan Sternberg as regular members of the Public Art & Culture Commission and Gail Riedy as an alternate member. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dave Waddington, Dennis Murray, Dick Brady, Wes Poole and Nikki Lloyd, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Birdea McCarthy, 1305 Cleveland Road, said she needs to know about the smoking ban and if it is for downtown, for people in vehicles, and how it will work. Dennis Murray said some of this has been addressed; it is not for downtown, it is only for city properties listed in the legislation. Birdea McCarthy asked when the city is going to do something for the kids here as they are not all privileged to be able to go to the sports center. Dennis Murray said the city has a recreation department which has announced beefing up our investment with full-time employees and they just finished a very successful spring break program for the kids in collaboration with the Sandusky City Schools. We expect to be doing more things like this and there is an extensive list of activities for kids in the parks. Birdea said all the city does is serve lunch and play games with these kids and it is only until 12 p.m. Kids get in trouble with the police and there is nothing for them to do. Dennis Murray said the city's programs are more extensive than are being described.

Carol Hey, 1024 Hayes Avenue, said she agrees we are losing the YMCA which is closing because of the age of the building and the board has decided because of the reduction in enrollment, they will just do away with it. The entire McArthur Park has nothing except other stuff to turn

to and this is a very sad situation for them to be going down. Not enough of the commissioners go down to the Jackson Street Pier on a daily basis and when she goes down there to sit and think about life there are cars coming and going. Johnson's Island is another shame that will happen to the city as they are tearing apart where most people, who cannot afford to go to the movie theatres or have no one to go with, to sit; their lives are being torn apart. The strips used to check the traffic should have been put here before deciding on greenspace. Carol Hey would like to make a recommendation to ban chewing gum at the city commission meetings as Nikki Lloyd - who put out the smoking ban and has a bar across from the pier - was chewing gum from 5 p.m. to 6:20 p.m. This is disrespectful and is the way she was taught. You might need a drink of water or a breath mint, but should not be chomping gum. She is the one who wanted the smoking ban and has the bar right across the street from the Jackson Street Pier and wait to see how many get turned in for the Ohio ban on her bar when they find out she owns it. Carol Hey said she pays her city taxes in the city she works in one hour away. When she used to live in an adjoining city, they were a forgiving city for income taxes and did not pay full taxes where she lived. Sandusky city tax is not forgiving and she has to work outside of the city while paying full city income tax and recommends the commission take a look forgiving this.

Marcie Platte, 1217 Columbus Avenue, said we have just given Cedar Point the entire east side of our waterfront. We are not allowing anyone else to develop this and are making it into a park which allows their people to go from one end to their hotels and asked if an environmental impact statement was done to see what will happen if we fill in a lot of Sandusky Bay. She asked who will police the enforcement of anything here. In thirty years, many in this room will probably not be alive or in these positions anymore. There are lots of tax abatements, but a lot of people are not going thirty years anymore, they are going fifteen or twenty so people can see the return. She used to go to Cedar Point when she was a kid and remembers paying nothing to park or go into the park. When she looks at these plans, there is not sufficient public parking for the average person to park their car. It is two miles for her to get to this place from her home on Columbus Avenue which is a significant distance. Everybody talks about the parking downtown and she thinks there is a master plan which the commission has not shared with the public, but the reality is Cedar Point has been trying to get their grips on a lot of this city for a long time. Ask the people on River Avenue how much Cedar Point has been wanting to get their houses and how much they would pay them. As city leaders, we need to be advocating for our public to have rights there and thirty years is a long time. There are a lot of people in the City of Sandusky who are feeling the city's energy and momentum is going for things which do not include them. They cannot afford \$15 - \$20 dinners in the new restaurants, but could afford to eat from a food truck on the pier but this will not be an option in the near future. She does not know how to repair this relationship so it does not become adversarial on both sides but it was disconcerting the Department of Health could have told what the actual rule was. Nikki Lloyd has also looked into this but they say every business is supposed to have a sign telling how to report violations and asked if the city is going to ensure every business downtown has this sign like the city is ensuring people are arrested for violations. It would be nice if this would be done both ways. As one cop's wife told her this now gives officers an avenue to question people and she would never have thought of that.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said she does not like blanket TIF agreements and this is dangerous. It looks like there is going to be a big sellout of city land and asked why they were put on this list. Some of the people on the list were Civista Bank, the Feick Building, the Sandusky Yacht Club and Mack Iron Works and these are big properties and something is going on, but we will not know until it hits this table and unfortunately it will be too late. When clientele comes off of the Goodtime, some of them will go to a motel or eat at a restaurant or go to a bar. One of the commissioners voted on this and her place is across the street.

Katherine Carter, 5309 Columbus Avenue, said a lot of people were at the cleanup last Saturday who also attended the meeting at the UAW Hall and does not see this as a reason to be an excuse for the commissioners to not attend. It was also stated answers were not available now about the smoking ban because it sounds as if this was well thought out to push it through.

Katherine Carter asked how much people will get fined for smoking on the Jackson Street Pier and where this money will go. There is no beer or alcohol in the parks but when there is a festival, alcohol is permitted in the parks and asked if smoking will be permitted when there are festivals.

Dashawn Bethea, 120 Perry Street, #1203, said smoking is a tough issue and is for the smoking ban and also for a lot of revitalization the city is doing. There are things being done to attract more people and get more people to live and visit. He is for Cedar Point and said they have done a lot for the city which draws tourists from all over the world. He is from Manhattan and our tourism is very important. He is happy he has lived here for three years now, could not have come to a better city and is grateful for everything the commissioners do for the city.

Greg Lockhart said the YMCA is moving to a new location and would like to see if we could research re-appropriating this building or moving our golf course building into this building or using this property potentially for recreation in some form or fashion. This might be able to be a nice golf course clubhouse or recreation center for people on this side of town.

At 8:33 p.m., upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to adjourn. President declared the motion passed.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Commission Clerk

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission