

The President called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after a moment of silence in honor and memory of retired Fire Fighter Ron Urig who served the city for 28 years, the Invocation, given by Naomi Twine, and the Pledge of Allegiance.

The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady.

City staff present: Aaron Klein - Director of Public Works, John Orzech - Police Chief, Rick Wilcox– Fire Chief, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Don Rumbutis - IT, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Sally Martin – Interim Finance Director, Trevor Hayberger – Law Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser – Commission Clerk.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to approve the Minutes of the December 9, 2019, meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Tom LaMarca, 206 48th Street, asked why the Tax Incremental Financing project is required to establish a Community Improvement Corporation (CIC). He asked for a list of the members and if this removes the city in the details and spending approvals and if the CIC is required to provide these details in an open and transparent fashion (Item #2).

SWEARING-IN

Trevor Hayberger asked Commissioner Wes Poole to raise his right hand and repeat the following:

I, Charles Wesley Poole, do solemnly swear that I will support, protect, and defend the Constitution of the United States and the State of Ohio and the Charter and Ordinances of the City of Sandusky; that I will honestly, faithfully and impartially discharge the duties of my office as a City Commissioner and not be influenced by any consideration except that of merit and fitness in the appointment or discharge of employees; that I am currently qualified to hold the office and will maintain all of the qualifications throughout my term in office in compliance with Section 4, Section 6 and Section 43 of the City Charter, so help me God.

Trevor Hayberger asked Commissioner Dave Waddington to raise his right hand and repeat the following:

I, David L. Waddington, do solemnly swear that I will support, protect, and defend the Constitution of the United States and the State of Ohio and the Charter and Ordinances of the City of Sandusky; that I will honestly, faithfully and impartially discharge the duties of my office as a City Commissioner and not be influenced by any consideration except that of merit and fitness in the appointment or discharge of employees; that I am currently qualified to hold the office and will maintain all of the qualifications throughout my term in office in compliance with Section 4, Section 6 and Section 43 of the City Charter, so help me God.

Trevor Hayberger asked Commissioner-Elect Mike Meinzer to raise his right hand and repeat the following:

I, Michael R. Meinzer, do solemnly swear that I will support, protect, and defend the Constitution of the United States and the State of Ohio and the Charter and Ordinances of the City of Sandusky; that I will honestly, faithfully and impartially discharge the duties of my office as a City Commissioner and not be influenced by any consideration except that of merit and fitness in the appointment or discharge of employees; that I am currently qualified to hold the office and will maintain all of the qualifications throughout my term in office in compliance with Section 4, Section 6 and Section 43 of the City Charter, so help me God.

Trevor Hayberger asked Commissioner-Elect Blake Harris to raise his right hand and repeat the following:

I, Blake A. Harris, do solemnly swear that I will support, protect, and defend the Constitution of the United States and the State of Ohio and the Charter and Ordinances of the City of Sandusky; that I will honestly, faithfully and impartially discharge the duties of my office as a City Commissioner and not be influenced by any consideration except that of merit and fitness in the appointment or discharge of employees; that I am currently qualified to hold the office and will maintain all of the qualifications throughout my term in office in compliance with Section 4, Section 6 and Section 43 of the City Charter, so help me God.

CURRENT BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS

The President asked if any of the commissioners wished to remove items from the Consent Agenda. There were no requests to do so.

SECOND READING

A. Submitted by Ariella Blanca, Community Development Manager

AMENDED PROGRAM AGREEMENT WITH THE OHIO HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact on the city's general fund.

ORINANCE NO. 19-217: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an amended Programmatic agreement for coordination between the city and the Ohio Historic Preservation Office for administration of programs using U.S. Department of Housing & Urban Development allocated funds.

B. Submitted by Nicole DeFreitas, Transit Administrator

SECOND AMENDMENT TO AGREEMENT WITH FIRST TRANSIT FOR THE SANDUSKY TRANSIT SYSTEM

Budgetary Information: The expansion of fixed route service is made possible because STS was awarded increased funding through the ODOT 5311, 5339 and OTP2 2020 grant awards, contract revenue, passenger fares and the city's general fund. The total cost of services is not to exceed \$600,000.00 for January 13, 2020 through March 31, 2020. Should the contract be renewed for the two one-year renewals, then the rates would be as follows:

April 1, 2020 through March 31, 2021 \$2,505,689.00

April 1, 2021 through March 31, 2022 \$2,591,395.00

Contract rates increase from current contract:

January 13, 2020 through March 31, 2020 \$152,222.00

April 1, 2020 through March 31, 2021 \$663,187.00

April 1, 2021 through March 31, 2022 \$695,052.00

ORDINANCE NO. 19-218: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a second amendment to the transportation services agreement between the City of Sandusky and First Transit, Inc., of Cincinnati, Ohio, in relation to the Sandusky Transit System; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

C. Submitted by Scott Thom, Chief Building Official

CONSULTING CONTRACT WITH ROBERT STADLER FOR ALTERNATE MASTER PLANS EXAMINER & ALTERNATE BUILDING OFFICIAL SERVICES

Budgetary Information: Mr. Stadler will be paid at the rate of \$55 per hour for work performed up to a maximum of \$7,500. The cost of this contract will be paid with the Building Division operating budget. The plan review expense will be paid by the collection of plan review fees by the Building Division. This contract can be terminated at any time, by either party, with thirty day notice to the other party.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-219: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a consulting contract with Robert G. Stadler for CY 2020; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

D. Submitted by Scott Thom, Chief Building Official

CONSULTING CONTRACT WITH GEORGE POULOS FOR PRIMARY ALTERNATE PLANS EXAMINER & BACKUP BUILDING OFFICIAL SERVICES

Budgetary Information: Mr. Poulos will be paid at the rate of \$2,000 per month for work performed for a total of \$24,000. The cost of this contract will be paid with the Building Division operating budget. The plan review expense will be paid by the collection of plan review fees by the Building Division. This contract can be terminated at any time, by either party, with thirty day notice to the other party.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-220: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a consulting contract with George J. Poulos for CY 2020; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

E. Submitted by Kelly Kresser, Commission Clerk

LIQUOR PERMIT TRANSFER FOR LONZ WINERY DBA FIRELANDS WINERY

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary impact for this item.

The City is in receipt of a Notice to Legislative Authority from the Ohio Division of Liquor Control for (stock) transfers of A1A (manufacturer of beer – producing more than 31 million gallons per year, wherever produced, and sell beer products to wholesale permit holders), A2 (Manufacturer of wine), B2A (Sale of wine to retail permit holder), D6 (Sale of intoxicating liquor on Sunday between the hours of 10 a.m. or 11 a.m. and midnight) and S (Sale of wine to personal consumer via mail order) liquor permits for Lonz Winery, Inc. dba Firelands Winery located at 917 Bardshar Road. It is requested the Commission Clerk be authorized to notify the Division the city does not request a hearing on this matter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda and declare all ordinances as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in full accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinances: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinances contained in the Consent Agenda passed in full accordance with the city charter.

REGULAR AGENDA

ITEM #1 – Submitted by Todd Gibson, Properties & Facilities Superintendent

CONTRACT WITH PROGRESSIVE CLEANING SOLUTIONS FOR CLEANING SERVICES AT CITY HALL

Budgetary Information: The total cost of the contract for years 2020 – 2021 is \$63,314.40. The cost of the cleaning services will be paid with general funds which have been budgeted for in the contractual services portion of the Building Maintenance operational and maintenance budget.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-221: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a two year agreement with Progressive Cleaning Solutions, Inc., of Sandusky, Ohio, for cleaning services at City Hall, 240 Columbus Avenue; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dave Waddington asked if this is the current cleaning company utilized by the city as he believes they do a good job; Aaron Klein affirmed it is. Nikki Lloyd suggested a review be done in two years to look at how many hours they spend cleaning because there is no guarantee of working 2½ hours each day, and a cost comparison should be done against cleaning services in-house. Wes Poole asked how the former City Hall at 222 Meigs Street is cleaned. Aaron Klein

said a part-time employee is used for that facility, five days each week and a couple of hours each day. It was too much for him to handle both buildings with his current schedule. Wes Poole asked if there is a reason why we did not hire another employee and do this in-house. Aaron Klein said this was a budgetary decision. He spoke with the union and it was agreed there was not a way they could provide these services for the same price as if it were bid.

Roll call on the motion: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #2 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

AGREEMENT WITH SANDUSKY COMMUNITY IMPROVEMENT CORPORATION

Budgetary Information: There is no specific budgetary impact with this piece of legislation; however, the city will ultimately be responsible for providing \$2,250,000 from the issuance of bonds in early 2020 through follow-up legislation.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-222: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing the execution of an agreement with the Sandusky Community Improvement Corporation (CIC) as the agency of the City of Sandusky, Ohio, for industrial, commercial, distribution and research development and authorizing and confirming a plan for such development, and declaring an emergency.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said there is a lot of question and concern as to the formation of the CIC and the distribution of the funds and asked for an explanation of the nature of the CIC and what it will be down the road. Matt Lasko said this is a related piece of legislation to the project funding agreement which was considered and approved at the last two commission meetings. The \$2.25 million in bonds which the city will be issuing to Cedar Point for the Sports Center project are a very specific type of bond known as Chapter 165 or industrial development bond. Per the Ohio Revised Code, this specific bond requires the existence of a Community Improvement Corporation which did not exist in past years. The CIC was formed and is a separate legal entity from the City of Sandusky. In order for bonds to be issued, the CIC must be formed and they must then enter into an Economic Development Plan with the municipality; secondarily, this plan must designate the CIC as the instrument of the city in the promotion of economic development. This legislation is to adopt both a broad economic development plan and designate the Sandusky CIC as an instrument of the city in the promotion of economic development. The nature of who the bond proceeds are being sold to dictates this requirement; the city is going to advance the interest of a private entity, that being Cedar Fair for the Sports Center project which will benefit a private entity although it will also benefit the public. This is the trigger for why a CIC needs to be created and why they will be under Chapter 165 bond structure. The members of the CIC as currently constituted are Eric Wobser, Sally Martin, Naomi Twine, Al Nickles and himself (Matt Lasko). The CIC was formed by the city's bond counsel, Katherine Tompkins. Moving forward, all meetings of the CIC must be advertised and open to the public and all minutes must be made available to the public. There will be two related pieces of legislation in 2020; one will be for the issuance of the bonds and who they are being sold to which the CIC has to specifically consider, approve and recommend the bonds being sold and to the benefit of the Cedar Point Sports Center project. Trevor Hayberger said the CIC was required for issuance of the bonds and this money will not flow through it or go to it. Trevor Hayberger said a lot of pressure has been put on the state to eliminate this provision because it seems needless, but as of now, it has not been removed and this step must be taken. Greg Lockhart asked about the creation of the CIC and what it will do down the road. Matt Lasko said the Articles of Incorporation were created and filed in mid-November and the actual election of officers occurred earlier this week. A resolution was passed to validate the board members. From there, the next step would be the adoption of this plan and the designation of the CIC as the entity and the Law Director can

authorize issuance of the bonds. Greg Lockart asked if ultimately this is all being created in the interest of the project and to the city and its partners. Matt Lasko said although not identical, this goes back to when the city created the Energy Special Improvement District a couple of years ago which was validated by the commission. This was for private projects seeking private financing. The city has no involvement from a funding or tax abatement standpoint but allows us to levy the assessments. Wes Poole asked the reason, advantage or disadvantage to choosing this type of bond. Matt Lasko said he does not know that there are advantages or disadvantages, this is merely required by virtue of the fact the bonds are being sold to finance improvements to a private property which benefit the private property. Had the city been issuing bonds for construction of the Sandusky Bay Pathway, as an example, the CIC would not be required. Wes Poole asked if this was the only choice in order for Cedar Point to have or finance this project. Matt Lasko said yes; through the issuance of bonds which will be backstopped by the project funding agreement, this is the only vehicle we can finance them through and the CIC must be involved in the transaction. Wes Poole asked how these are paid back and Matt Lasko said the project funding agreement passed by the City Commission set a minimum payment to the city of \$550,000, payable in two installments each year of \$275,000. Once the city disburses the \$2.25 million to Cedar Fair, these will be paid back to the city by virtue of these semi-annual project funding agreement payments. Wes Poole said this is what happens when legislation is sent on Wednesday and he has to figure it out by Friday. He understands this is what the law says but asked Matt Lasko to talk about the portion in the agreement which states “may incur debt, mortgage its property” and if this represents mortgaging its own property to make loans, sell property or what this references and if it includes the entire city (property). Matt Lasko said a CIC is a non-profit corporation albeit not a tax exempt non-profit corporation. Like any corporation or entity, it can buy real estate, provide mortgages or provide loans, but it is an entity which has no money. The city is not on the hook to fund it but it does have any and all rights any entity could have. He would be surprised if we ever have to use this vehicle again although he cannot say we never will. This is an instance of this project we are funding but rights are provided to the corporation as any legal entity.

Roll call on the motion: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #3 - Submitted by Sally Martin, Interim Finance Director

FINAL BUDGET APPROPRIATIONS FOR CY 2019

Budgetary Information: This action will cover anticipated expenditures through December 31, 2019. The agenda deadline occurs before the final payroll costs can be determined. The amendment needs to cover final payroll and other projected costs through December 31, 2019.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-223: It is requested an ordinance be passed adopting Amendment No. 4 to Ordinance No. 19-054 passed by this City Commission on March 25, 2019, making general appropriations for the fiscal year 2019; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said this is an item we normally place on the Consent Agenda as it is rather routine and we usually get to this at the last meeting of the year. These appropriations are being made to adjust the city budget to ‘catch us up’ with all of the different legislation passed by the commission since the last update. Sally Martin said it is basically clean-up legislation for year-end to enable us to start fresh in the new year first with the temporary budget and then with the budget as passed. Wes Poole asked if adding this at the end of the year is the only way we can finance things; he understands this is something we have always done under the concept of not really understanding if we are in good shape or bad shape. Sally Martin said we set up the

budget with certain amounts at the beginning of the year; as things turn out with big projects, we do not always know how much will be spent for the year and is taken back if not all spent and/or reallocated at the beginning of the year. This is a routine cleaning up with the majority to bring items back to their budgeted amounts. Wes Poole said he does not necessarily think there is an easier way to understand this dealing with individual departments as we seem to be adding all kinds of money at the end of the year to a budget which we should have known and stayed by. Dick Brady said, to be clear, this is not adding or subtracting money, it is simply an account of the actual money spent and represents changes in a project for deducts, as an example. If there was an add-on to a contract, there is nothing in this legislation which the commission has not approved or voted on. It is inappropriate to think or characterize it as adding money; it is simply an accounting of the money which the commission has voted on throughout the year. Dennis Murray said he has a friend who says there is 'accounting' and there is 'government accounting' because it is odd, but is a function of how the accounting works and this is what we need to do to clean up the books at the end of the year. A private corporation would not go through this but we, as a public body, do.

Roll call on the motion: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #4 - Submitted by Sally Martin, Interim Finance Director

TEMPORARY APPROPRIATIONS FOR JANUARY, FEBRUARY & MARCH, 2020

Budgetary Information: This action will establish a budget for operations until the annual appropriations can be approved after the second Monday in January, 2020. The city charter prohibits the city from enacting the 2020 budget before January 13, 2020.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-224: It is requested an ordinance be passed making temporary appropriations for the months of January, February and March, 2020, and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Sally Martin said this is based on funds allowing the city to do business for the first few months of the year prior to finalizing the budget and gives us about one quarter of the amount needed for the year. It will allow us to keep the lights and gas on and things like this. Dennis Murray said there is something a little odd about our charter which does not allow us to adopt a budget until after we already started the new year, but some cities are not set up this way. Dave Waddington said beyond the first three months of the year, we have an extra payroll in next year's budget.

Roll call on the motion: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

ITEM #5 – Submitted by Sally Martin, Interim Finance Director

TRANSFER OF FUNDS FOR PAYROLL STABILIZATION FUND

Budgetary Information: The agenda deadline occurs before the amount can be determined. The resolution, along with the amount, will be available at the meeting.

RESOLUTION NO. 046-19R: It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing the transfer of funds from the general fund to the payroll stabilization fund; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said the city has long had a payroll stabilization fund and we have been able to add to it in recent years because the budget has been strong. We know there are employees with long tenure who have some accumulated time and are entitled to certain compensation when they leave us and is why this fund was created. In bad years it was down to zero, but it allows us to be able to accommodate these obligations without impacting the city's general fund. In 2020, we have an extra payroll period and rather than throw our budget off, we have added money for this. Eric Wobser said this fund was set up smartly several years ago and as times became more financially difficult, it was depleted. As we have been able to stabilize revenues over the past several years, we have built it up quite a bit and at one point, was up nearly to \$800,000 before making a transfer to take it down. We are recommending a transfer of additional funds of \$400,000 next year primarily to cover the 27th payroll. Ultimately, we will still keep enough in this fund to satisfy what we assume will be the obligations over the next three to five years. Sally Martin said we will be slightly over \$1 million when we make this transfer. Our payroll averages anywhere from \$650,000 to \$700,000 so this gives us \$300,000; this year's termination payouts were approximately \$160,000 so we should have a little something left over and will continue to fund this as we always budget a certain amount. Dennis Murray asked how often we have an extra payroll period and Eric Wobser said he believes they occur every eleven years or so. Dennis Murray said a lot of companies and governments have gone to bi-monthly payrolls and said we may want to consider this in the future to avoid this situation. Eric Wobser said once the new Finance Director is here, we can look at this with the members of the Audit/Finance Committee.

Roll call on the motion: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept a donation from in the amount of \$100 from Jack Kenning for the K9 fund. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to accept a donation of 15 cases of Gatorade from Northern Haserot Food Service for use in the Recreation Department's upcoming Winter Break Camp at Sandusky High School. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **Eric Wobser thanked Nikki Lloyd and Greg Lockhart for their four years of service and said it has been great to work with them. They are both very passionate, and will continue to be passionate, about Sandusky. He also welcomed Commissioners-Elect Mike Meinzer and Blake Harris and said he looks forward to working with them in the new year.**
- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to place John Orzech into the position of Assistant City Manager.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said John Orzech, who in addition to his role as Police Chief, has been serving as the Safety Service Director, providing oversight to both the Police and Fire Departments. We have worked closely with him as he is looking at the next steps for his career and ultimately for the city's needs with the amount of growth and projects we have taken on in the last few years. He is ready to make a transition and wanted to let the City Commission know, effective January, 2020, John's title of Acting

Service Director will transition to Assistant City Manager. He will continue to serve as Police Chief during this time but the new City Commission will be asked to put together a search committee to select a new Chief of Police. At that time, he will transition out of his role as the Chief and full-time into the role of Assistant City Manager. In this new role, he will continue to provide oversight of the Police and Fire Departments but will take on an expanded role with special projects – one of the biggest will be working with Public Works and the Sandusky Municipal Court to create a new police station and justice center. This will allow the new Police Chief to focus on the role on the job without also being liaison to this project in addition to the many other duties of the Police Chief. In looking at the additional opportunities for John Orzech while transitioning out of the role of Police Chief, it became natural to make this transition because of the respect people have for him already. Having the position of Assistant City Manager filled will allow us to be even more productive. John Orzech will move into the City Manager's Office at the beginning of next year and he (Eric) is very excited to have him in this role. We will have a chance to be very deliberate in filling the very large shoes he has created as Chief of Police. Dennis Murray said he is so glad Eric Wobser is taking this step and is grateful we are able to continue to have Chief Orzech advise and serve the city. Dave Waddington said this is a very good choice and he is very supportive of it. Naomi Twine said she has worked closely with John Orzech since being on the City Commission and also previously; this is a great choice. He is very level-headed and does not lose his temper easily. He has established relationships in the community, especially in the law enforcement community, and looks forward to this next chapter in his life and is looking forward to working with him administratively. Dick Brady said John Orzech has found a way to develop community police throughout our city and this has allowed our city to gain the respect of our residents while our residents have gained the respect of our police. While doing all this, he has gained the respect of the other employees of the city and this is a combination for success in anything he does. He joins his colleagues in welcoming him to this new challenge. He is optimistic John will be ultimately successful in this next phase. Dave Waddington said from what he is hearing, we do not need to wait until January and is supportive of this. Wes Poole said John Orzech will do well in any position we give him and he has done a fine job for us as Police Chief. We have at least one other position in our budget we plan to fill and would appreciate having some job description or discussion as to whether or not we need these positions because this is just good business. For the commission to justify creating another position the taxpayers have to pay for, they are entitled to know we have done some sort of due diligence to indicate it is necessary and not frivolous. This should be included with the budget material because there are other positions requested. Dennis Murray said he heard Eric Wobser sketched out a job description and is quite confident he has it written. Eric Wobser said this is something we have taken very seriously and do have a draft job description to circulate. As to the budget, this was something we had in mind about transitioning to when we created the position of Safety Service Director going into 2018. We were thoughtful that by not filling the Assistant Police Chief position upon the retirement of Phil Frost and not filling the position of Assistant Fire Chief in the Fire Department for the past two years, we can take advantage of Chief Orzech's expertise in these areas. He will work with Chief Wilcox and the selected Police Chief to keep budget-neutral and there will not be an impact. Additionally, the new Police Chief will not be selected until later in 2020. Chief Orzech will not take additional compensation or benefits, his contract will stay the same and we will work at a pace the commission is comfortable with. Nikki Lloyd said she knows the City Manager has been thinking about this for a long time and from a structure standpoint, it makes sense, and feels it will make everything stronger and flow a lot better. Chief Orzech is the absolute best person for this job and supports the motion. Wes Poole said other than how several individuals feel about this, there has been nothing presented to this commission at all which justifies doing this. He is not opposed to doing this, but has a problem with doing things which appears to have been decided someplace else. At no point in time has there been anything presented

to this commission or to the public to suggest we needed this position. He is not fighting against it, he thinks it is inappropriate to get a couple of comments from folks who are just willing to vote for it after saying what a great person this gentleman is and suddenly we have a position. All of the things said are possibly true but if we are going to do a budget, the budget should be written out with justifications. We have been very generous over the last three years in allowing the City Manager to just put people on without the commission making any comment whatsoever about whether or not they are justified. We have not been going back to see what the work was or measured its impact on the community; we have simply been spending money and this is his only concern about this as it is not a good way to do business. Just because a couple of commissioners think he is a nice guy and the City Manager wants him to do something is not a good way to do business and he will vote no on this for this very reason. We have done just enough talky-talk and just say 'okay', but we need to do this professionally and like a business which is his concern for taxpayer money. Something should be written on paper justifying this and discussion about it ahead of time. Greg Lockhart said procedurally his question is if this is something which should be put out for public bid in case someone else is just as qualified for the role. He asked if a replacement is being made for the position of the Safety Service Director or if it will be eliminated. Eric Wobser said the role of the Safety Service Director was always as "Acting" and did not have this position in the city previously so this would go away. Chief Orzech will then assume the duties of this position as well as the other duties with his time capacity when no longer serving as the day-to-day Chief of Police. Generally speaking, positions within the approved budget are generally the prerogative of the City Manager as the Charter is set up and structured although every year he defines in the budget what new positions are intended to be filled before the commission vote. New full-time positions are snuck in without having the opportunity to ask if they are necessary. We can talk about the positions created over the last few years and what roles they are playing but this is partially why he is coming to the commission now rather than at the time the budget is passed. We would like to make this transition earlier, but have never filled a created position which did not come to the commission first because ultimately the commission approves the budget as they do become long-term costs to the city.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine and Dick Brady, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the motion passed.

- **Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to affirm hiring Michelle Reeder to fill the vacant position of Finance Director who will begin employment in early January, 2020.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said **Michelle Reeder has been hired to fill the vacant Finance Director position** which was previously occupied by Hank Solowiej. The city conducted a search and applications were due on November 30 with 32 applicants for the position. Eric Wobser, Sally Martin, Trevor Hayberger and Connie Nicholson conducted interviews with the finalists and unanimously selected Michelle Reeder. Michelle was the Finance Director for the City of Norwalk and came highly recommended in addition to having strong references, interviews and resume. She was introduced to the leadership of the Audit/Finance Committee and they also strongly supported her as a candidate. A conditional offer of employment was made to serve as the next Finance Director and Michelle and her husband keep a second home in the city and spend a lot of time here. Sally Martin has done an incredible job filling in under difficult circumstances and we are very grateful for her time. Dennis Murray said a few years ago the city's charter was changed so the positions of Finance Director and Law Director were direct reports to the City Manager and this has worked out very well. The Charter also requires the commission to vote on this appointment when the City Manager seeks to hire a new Law Director or Finance Director. Nikki

Lloyd said she looked through the information distributed and is excited to see we have someone who is already supporting Sandusky, is qualified and local; this is a good choice and she is looking forward to Michelle being here. Dennis Murray said Michelle will be able to hit the ground running with her previous years of experience.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

- Officers Makayla Cook and Mason Dye both completed the 40-hour course for **Crisis Intervention Team Training (CIT)**. CIT programs across the country help direct persons with mental illness into treatment instead of inappropriate incarceration. The training provides practical techniques for de-escalating crises. Officers learn to integrate their police training with some different approaches to a person they believe to have a mental disorder. Role playing is utilized to make the experience as close to reality as possible.
- Fire Fighters will be assisting OHgo in distributing Christmas trees and gifts. On Christmas Eve, the **Sandusky Fire Department Station #1 on Market Street will turn into Santa's Workshop**. The station will open from 8 a.m. to 8 p.m. to put toys together and items may be dropped off to be assembled. Pick up is by midnight Christmas Eve. If there are any questions, please call Diane at 419.627.5822.
- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to provide pay raises to administrative employees of two percent for those making over \$70,000, and three percent for those making under \$70,000.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said members of both the Administrative Benefit Review Committee and the Audit/Finance Committee have recommended a two-tier system for cost of living adjustments for non-bargaining employees, effective with the first pay period of 2020. Any non-bargaining employee who has a base annual salary under \$70,000 would receive a three percent increase, and anyone earning over \$70,000 would receive a two percent increase. The next step is to have the City Commission approve this recommendation.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

- Eric Wobser said as a general reminder to property owners of vacant dwellings who may expect their dwelling to remain **vacant and unoccupied during the winter months**, we highly recommend contacting our Customer Accounting Office to have the water turned off. This will help prevent water lines from freezing and breaking which could lead to costly repairs. The Customer Accounting Office number is 419.627.5893.
- Eric Wobser said he would like to congratulate the following **staff for their promotions:**

Ed Dayringer was promoted to Chief Construction Inspector in the Engineering Division. **Connor Lenthe** was promoted to Shift Operator I at the Waste Water Treatment Plant. **Al Percival** was promoted to Lab Technician II at Big Island Water Works.

We would also like to **welcome the following new staff:**

Justina McCutcheon as an Operator II at Big Island Water Works and **Justin McKillips** as a Maintenance II in Forestry.

- The contractors working on **the Jackson Street Pier and Shoreline Drive will secure their construction sites starting today** and will return in 2020. With all of the construction continuing over the next few weeks, please remember to take extreme caution and pay attention to all signs as you travel the city to celebrate the holidays.
- The Forestry Division will be performing **Christmas tree collection** throughout the city during the week of January 6 and will distribute further details through our website, the press and social media. Residents may also drop Christmas trees from January 4 to January 12 at two locations: the Shelby Street Boat Launch overflow parking lot or the Kiwanis Park parking lot. For questions regarding Christmas tree collection, please call 419.627.5884.
- The Streets & Traffic crews have made two rounds through each zone for the **leaf collection program**. They will drive through the city checking for additional leaves during the final weeks in December. Additionally, we are extending the drop-off period for those who have not met the schedule. Residents are welcome to drop their leaves near the Marquette Drive entrance to the city service center seven days a week until the end of January. Dennis Murray thanked the employees for this and said by this time there would have been some hiccups which had come to the attention of the commission, but he has not heard one and this is very much appreciated.
- The **Economic Development Incentive Committee meeting** is January 14 at 1:30 p.m. in the City Commission chambers.
- The **Planning Commission** meeting is January 22 at 4:30 p.m. at 240 Columbus Avenue in the City Commission chambers.
- The **Board of Zoning Appeals** meeting is January 16 at 4:30 p.m. at 240 Columbus Avenue in the City Commission chambers.
- The **Landmark Commission** meeting is January 15 at 4 p.m. at 240 Columbus Avenue in the City Commission chambers.
- The regular **Public Arts and Culture Commission** meeting is January 21 at 5:15 p.m. at 240 Columbus Avenue in the City Commission chambers
- The City of Sandusky Recreation Department is proud to announce the winners in the **2019 #RUNDUSKY Race Series Grand Prize package**. Kathy Capodice and Kurt Kresser, both of Sandusky, each won entry to all seven 2019 participating races in 2020, a \$50 gift card to the North Shore Running Store in downtown Sandusky and entry to one of the Rite Aid Cleveland Marathon races in May. The **#RUNDUSKY Race Series** had over 80 participants who ran at least five of the seven races and qualified for a free hooded sweatshirt provided by Firelands Regional Medical Center. Over 50 participants ran six or more of the seven races to qualify for the race package drawing and ten of those ran all seven races of the series. The race series resulted in over 400 registrations to Sandusky races with an average of 58 participants in each race. The average age per participant in the series was 44.5 years old. The series will be back with two additional races in 2020.

OLD BUSINESS

None.

NEW BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to accept an in-kind donation of a time capsule from Janotta & Herner and an in-kind donation of a new wood base for the Boy with the Boot statue from Todd Gibson, Sr.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said the Boy with the Boot has been returned to City Hall and expressed thanks for the persons involved with making this happen. The base of the Boy with the Boot also contains a time capsule with items from our Bicentennial celebration and is scheduled to be opened fifty years from now. The time capsule was built and donated to the city by Janotta and Herner and Ted Kastor was instrumental in making sure this was done. The items within the time capsule were collected, sealed and placed by McKenzie Spriggs who coordinated our year-long Bicentennial celebration although no one knows what the contents are. Todd Gibson, Sr., or Facilities & Properties Superintendent, donated much of his time and talent to build the new wooden base which houses the time capsule and on which the Boy with the Boot sits on. We are thankful for all who participated in creating this and said it is good to have the Boy back where he belongs. This one is the original while the one in Washington Park is a replica of the statue.

The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to hold an Executive Session regarding personnel, City Manager compensation. Roll call on the motion: Yeas; Dave Waddington, Greg Lockhart, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and Dick Brady, 7. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to adopt the 2020 City Commission meeting schedule, as distributed by the Commission Clerk, as well as setting the organizational meeting for January 13, 2020. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to make the following appointments or reappointments (as distributed by the Commission Clerk):

- **Reappointment of Martha Thompson, Kathy Linz, Brian Stanley and Kathy Wickens to the ADA/Fair Housing Board through December 31, 2022; new appointment of Eddie Brown through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Jim Ruthsatz, Craig Stahl and Al Nickles to the Audit/Finance Committee through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Kevin Zeiher, Dan Delahunt and Bill Semans to the Board of Zoning Appeals through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Tom Darden and Kevin Zeiher to the Oakland Cemetery Board & Memorial Park through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Anthony Harris, Daryl Murphy and Taylor Sutphen to the Community Relations Commission through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Dan Fresch, Mike Oglesbee, Chris Lemma and Steve Rucker to the Electrician Examining Board through December 31, 2022;**
- **Appointment of Matt Lasko to the Erie County Economic Development Board of Directors, the Erie County Land Bank Committee Board of Directors and the Erie County Economic Development Council representative;**
- **Reappointment of David Miller to the Erie Regional Planning Commission through December 31, 2020;**

- **Reappointment of David Brink and Bob Runner to the Income Tax Board of Review through December 31, 2021;**
- **Reappointment of Jim Jackson and Pete McGory to the Planning Commission through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Marsha Carrington and Adam Ramsdell to the Public Arts & Culture Commission through December 31, 2022;**
- **Reappointment of Bernie Seiler and Sherrie Waddington to the Recreation Board through December 31, 2022; new appointment of Jonathon Monroe through December 31, 2020;**
- **Reappointment of BreAnn Hohman and Joe Viviano to the Sandusky Tree Commission through December 31, 2022.**

The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to set a Public Hearing on February 10 regarding a request to amend the zoning map according to an application filed by McGookey Properties to expand the Cove District's transient overlay district.

Discussion: Wes Poole asked for a description of what this is for since we are announcing a meeting. Kelly Kresser said the request was submitted and the city is required to hold a Public Hearing after a 30-day notification period prior to it taking place; the Planning Department will provide a full publication of the request in the newspaper and online in the next few days. Trevor Hayberger said there is a boundary for the transient rental overlay district and the McGookey property is at the tip of it along with the next two or three parcels going west on Washington Street. He is asking these additional properties be included in the district.

The President declared the motion passed.

Nikki Lloyd said she has been reflecting a lot over the last month and has been thinking about all of the things we have accomplished during the past four years which has been truly amazing. This week, someone described her as the most non-political official they had ever met and she laughed, but it is true, and maybe this is how it should be on some level. She has heard people say many times Sandusky is not ready for that business in Sandusky and it would only work in bigger ones, but this is where they are wrong. She does not want to hear the word 'no' nor does she not want to hear 'it is not possible'. Not knowing the ins and outs of politics basically meant she was not jaded by tradition or policy. She came in looking at this position as a business. Policy can be changed and traditions can be broken. The success of a city rides a fine line between running a business and having to take care of your family. There are hard decisions to make but the end goal is to be successful and happy. Sandusky still has so much potential and she is so proud of what we have accomplished in such a short timeframe. Adopting a Bicentennial Vision Plan, supporting longstanding small businesses in our community while also attracting new investors to the area all are at the same time just a few of the highlights. Our successes give others the courage to take a chance and taking a chance on Sandusky is what she did seven years ago and could not be happier. We should all be proud of the strides we have made through the years. Sandusky has gained national attention because of decisions made by this commission and the leadership of our outstanding City Manager. This not only strengthens our relationships with our stakeholders, but encourages others to have confidence to believe in Sandusky and what Sandusky can do for them. Nikki Lloyd thanked the commissioners who have stood by her side throughout her term. She knows she can be quite passionate at times and knows this probably creates some anxiety, but she appreciates it. She thanked the city staff for all they do and knows this can sometimes be a thankless job at times and asked them to always remember there is a silent majority who are ecstatic about what is happening in this community. Keep up the good

work. To the Commissioners-Elect, Nikki Lloyd said to ask a lot of questions, share thoughts and ideas and do not back down. We still have more work to do as she does and she will be wearing a different hat and will continue to support Sandusky's progression.

Greg Lockhart thanked Eric Wobser and said working with him has been an interesting experience in addition to working with Matt Lasko, other staff members and the commissioners. When coming into politics, there must truly be something in your heart because without it you have nothing when you are gone. He learned a lot from his fellow commissioners and it is almost like the Wizard of Oz with the different characters who want something; you pick up pieces as you go along and he is grateful for this. In the future, there are a few things he would like to see worked on including shoring up our public safety, building a new fire station or renovating the west end, making sure we have good infrastructure and good drivable roads and attracting and maintaining small businesses which is one of the cornerstones of what we should do. One of the very first things he did when he came into office was to look at Imagine Baking on Hancock Street. They were initially rebuffed but have come to change because of a city administration which was more welcoming to small business. We were able to turn around a small business in this neighborhood and make significant improvements to the amount of about \$400,000. He has seen investments in a few different ways and growth investments from developers which are long-term. We have the shareholder investments and we hope to keep them here to ultimately grow the city. We have defensive investments he hopes to see bond projects which shelter and hold up investments made. We are sure to have nice parks everywhere for everyone and lastly, diversifying our workforce so it looks like our city, not just our income levels. Greg Lockhart thanked everyone for their spirited debate and advice.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

John Adams, Chaplain for the Sandusky Police Department, said he has worked extremely closely with Chief John Orzech. He speaks to his character and recognizes both his love for the City of Sandusky and for the people who work for it. This will be a change but we have all benefitted from his years as Police Chief. Things change and he appreciates the commission supporting what he has done and the difference he has made in the city. He has run his race with honor and not everybody gets to do this nor do they get to leave on their own terms but John Orzech is being able to do this with extreme integrity and honor.

At 4:47 p.m., the President announced a recess of the regular session.

At 5:24, p.m., the commission reconvened in open session.

ORDINANCE NO. 19-225: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing the termination of the existing employment agreement with the City Manager, Eric L. Wobser; approving and authorizing the execution of a new employment agreement between the City of Sandusky and Eric L. Wobser, and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to adopt this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said this document should not be considered valid as it was prepared by a city employee for a city employee; he said it should have been prepared by an outside attorney rather than the city's Law Director. The contract is vague and does not provide protections for the city; he would like it to be clearer and will not vote affirmatively based on his objections. Dennis Murray said the City Manager is doing an extraordinary job and this contract provide security for the city to retain Eric Wobser as long as we can; he understands the concern expressed, but does not believe it is valid. Wes Poole said the City Manager is doing a good job and hopes he stays here, but has a problem with a contract being written by an employee (the Law Director) who is reviewed by the person the contract is for (the City Manager). Two outgoing commissioners are being asked to approve this contract which states in the terms outlined in

Section 2 of the agreement the contract is automatically renewed. The City Commissioners who are here eight years from now should not be locked into this agreement. He said the citizens are entitled to consideration of this agreement.

Upon motion of Greg Lockhart and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to table this item. Roll call on the motion to table: Yeas: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. Nays: Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine and Dick Brady, 5. The President declared the motion to table failed.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Dick Brady, the motion was amended to set the City Manager's salary at \$150,000.

Discussion: Dick Brady said his biggest fear is losing Eric Wobser if there is not a contract in place for him. He is in contact with people in the community every day who value him as our City Manager.

Roll call on the motion, as amended: Yeas: Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd, Dennis Murray, Naomi Twine and Dick Brady, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion, as amended, passed.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to adjourn at 5:35 p.m. The President declared the motion passed.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Commission Clerk

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission